Sāmaññ,phala Sutta

The fruits of recluseship

[The immediate benefits of the holy life]
(Digha Nikaya 2/1:47-86)
Translated with notes by Piya Tan ©2002, 2003, 2004

INTRODUCTION

1 The patricide king

The Sāmaññ,phala Sutta is the second text of the Dīgha Nikāya (the Long Collection). This text is a dialogue between the Buddha and the rajah Ajāta,sattu (Skt *Ajāta,śatru*)[1] of Magadha on what constitutes the visible and immediate benefits of the life of a renunciant. It is a classic study of the Buddha's skill in teaching.

In psychological terms, it is a case study of how the Buddha heals the mind of a guilt-ridden patricide. Ajātasattu, on the instigation of Devadatta (who himself had planned to usurp the Buddha's position over the Sangha), attempted to kill the Buddha (by sending out archers) and left his own father, Bimbisāra,[2] to die in prison, in around 493 BCE. In due course, he feared that his own son, Udāyi,bhadda (Skt. Udāyi,bhadra) would kill him and usurp his throne in 461 BCE.

Udāyi,bhadda was in turn murdered by *his* son. He was succeeded by four kings and tradition has it that they were all patricides. The dynasty ended when the people of Magadha became disgusted with this destructive tendency, deposed the last king, and appointed a viceroy, Śiśunāga, as king.[3]

2 The threefold training

The Sāmaññ,phala Sutta is very useful because it provides a very comprehensive survey of the Buddha's teaching on the threefold training of moral virtue (*sīla*), meditation (*samādhi*) and wisdom (*paññā*). Each stage of the teaching is presented in a gradually ascending level with striking similes.[4]

Graeme MacQueen, a renowned Canadian Buddhist scholar and peace activist, while he was a lecturer at McMaster University, presented a comprehensive and insightful thesis entitled **"A Study of the Śrāmaṇyaphala-Sūtra."**[5] The singular value of this thesis lies in its interdisciplinary and comparative approach. Graeme analyzes the Sūtra from scriptural ("the ancient text"), literary ("themes and thematic changes") and historical ("the text family") angles. He made a comparative study of at least five major texts of the Sūtra, quoting from Chinese and Tibetan sources, but giving a balanced prominence to the Pali text.

3 The moralities

Sections 8-27 of **the Brahma,jāla Sutta** (D 1) comprises 13 groups or items on moral conduct, divided into three parts in ascending order of length: (1) the short section or short tract (*cūḷa,sīla*) [§§8-10], (2) the medium section or medium tract (*majjhima,sīla*) [§§11-20], and (3) the great section or long tract (*mahā,sīla*) [§§21-27].[6] Except for a few minor variations, these three sections are found in all of the first 13 suttas of the Chapter on Morality (*sīla,vagga*), and may once have formed a separate "tract" (D:RD 1:3 n1). They probably form one of the earliest parts of the Dīgha Nikāya (Norman 1983:32).

---

[1] On historical difficulties regarding Ajātasattu, see Bronkhorst 1993:117 f.
[2] On Bimbisāra, see Peter Skilling, *Mahāsūtras. Great Discourses of the Buddha,* vol 2, 1997:316-327.
[3] See Romila Thapar, *The Penguin History of Early India,* 2003:154 f.
[4] For a more detailed discussion, see ***Sīla Samādhi Paññā*** = SD 21.6.
[5] Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1988.
[6] D 1/1:1-46 = SD 25.

This famous and ancient treatise on moral virtue or "moralities" (*sīla*) forms the beginning section on "the fruit of recluseship" (*sāmaññ,phala*) and finds its best known expression in the Sāmaññ,phala Sutta. Understandably, the whole set of teachings comprising moral virtue [43-63], mental development [64-86], the knowledge of supernormal powers [87-96], and the development of liberating wisdom [97-98], are known by the same name, *sāmaññ,phala*.[7]

The best study of the moralities (*sīla*) is that done by **Damien Keown** in his *The Nature of Buddhist Ethics* (1992:25-35), and I have here drawn much of the materials from Keown. Based on Rhys Davids's translation, the three tracts may be summarized as follows,[8] that is, they are abstentions from all of the following:

THE SHORT MORALITIES

1. Taking life.
2. Taking what has not been given.
3. Unchastity.
4. Lying.
5. Slanderous speech.
6. Harsh speech.
7. Frivolous talk.
8. Causing injury to seeds or plants.
9. Eating more than once and after midday.
10. Watching shows, fairs, dancing, singing and music.
11. Ornaments, garlands, scents and unguent.
12. Use of large and lofty beds.
13. Accepting gold and silver [money].
14. Accepting of uncooked grain.
15. Accepting raw meat.
16. Accepting women or girls.
17. Accepting bondsmen or bondswomen.
18. Accepting sheep or goats.
19. Accepting fowls or swine.
20. Accepting elephants, cattle, horses and mares.
21. Accepting cultivated fields or sites.
22. Acting as a go-between or messenger.
23. Buying and selling.
24. Cheating with scales, bronzes or measures.
25. Bribery, cheating and fraud.
26. Maiming, murdering, putting in bonds, highway robbery, dacoity and violence.

THE MEDIUM MORALITIES

1. Injury to seedlings and plants.
2. Use of things stored up (food, drink, clothes, provisions, etc.).
3. Visiting shows (16 kinds specified).
4. Games and recreation (18 kinds specified).
5. High and large couches (20 kinds specified).
6. Adorning and beautifying the person.
7. Low forms of discourse (eg stories and gossip).
8. Argumentative phrases.
9. Acting as a go-between or messenger.
10. Simony [religious commercialism].

---

[7] See Gethin 2001:195 f.
[8] Cf JDM Derret 1983:12.

THE GREAT MORALITIES

Wrong livelihood earned by:

1. The low arts, such as palmistry.
2. Knowledge of the signs of good and bad qualities in things denoting the health or luck of their owner.
3. Soothsaying.
4. Foretelling eclipses, etc.
5. Foretelling rainfall, etc.
6. Use of charms and incantations.
7. Use of medicine and drugs.

These items are not entirely a strange and random list, but have an interesting order. Taking them in reverse, we find that "**the great moralities**" (*mahā,sīla*) direct their attention specifically to undesirable livelihood through a variety of practices known as "the low arts" (*tiracchāna,vijjā*). "**The medium moralities**" (*majjhima,sīla*) list only two additional practices not mentioned in "**the short moralities**" (*cūḷa.sīla*), namely, item 2 (the use of things stored up), and item 4 (games and recreations). On the other hand, there are many omissions from the list of the "short moralities." Besides embracing many of the concerns of the "medium moralities," the "short moralities" also refers to undesirable forms of livelihood, the central theme of the "long moralities."

> It would seem, therefore, that the *Short Tract* [short moralities] has a claim to be considered as the primary one of the three, and that the *Medium Tract* [medium moralities] and *Long Tract* [great moralities] expand on certain aspects of it. For example, the *Short Tract* prohibits attendance at shows (item 10), and the *Medium Tract* then goes on to specify sixteen kinds of shows included in the prohibition. Again, the *Short Tract* prohibits the use of high beds (item 12) and the *Medium Tract* stipulates twenty examples of the kinds of bed to be avoided. Likewise, the *Short Tract* prohibits numerous kinds of wrong livelihood (13-26), and the *Long Tract* adds to this by describing various kinds of fortune-telling which should be avoided. It is as if the *Medium* and *Long Tracts* have been tagged on to add precision, plug loopholes, or resolve disputes which may have arisen over the interpretation of the *Short Tract.* The *Long Tract* perhaps has more claim to independence than the *Medium Tract* since fortune-telling and soothsaying, to which it is mainly devoted, are not specifically mentioned in the *Short Tract.* (Keown 1992:27 f)

Furthermore, **the short moralities** are regarded as primary in that other lists of the Buddhist moral precepts consist largely of a reformulation of its items. The 26 short moralities fall into four loose groupings, that is, those concerning:

1. Avoidance of immoral acts of body and speech (1-7).
2. Austerity in lifestyle (8-12).
3. Offerings not to be accepted (13-21).
4. Avoidance of commercial or criminal activity (22-26).

Each of these groupings shows the normative concern primarily in regards to matters concerning the life of a recluse (*samaṇa*). Indeed, the moralities as a whole occur as a eulogy to the Buddha *as a recluse*. The individual items are introduced by presenting them as observance of the recluse Gotama himself.

> Consider the first of the *Short Tract*: "Putting aside the killing of living things, Gotama the *samaṇa* refrains from the destruction of life" [43(1)]. The *Tracts* in *Brahma's Net* [D 1.8-27/1:4-11] taken as a whole are an attempt to encapsulate the conduct of Gotama the *samaṇa.* The *Short Tract* seeks to define what is most essential in this by specifying the conduct of Gotama, while the *Medium* and *Long Tracts* distinguish the conduct of Gotama from other less worthy *Samaṇas* and *Brāhmaṇas.* Thus the latter two *Tracts* adopt the stock refrain: "Whereas some *Samaṇas* and

Brāhmaṇas do X, Gotama the *Samaṇa* does Y." This may be seen in the first item of the *Long Tract*:

> Whereas some *Samaṇas* and *Brāhmaṇas*, while living off food provided by the faithful, continue attached [to such and such conduct], Gotama the *Samaṇa* refrains from this. [46-62]

In summary, the moralities first of all describe, in the short moralities, what is integral to the conduct of an ideal recluse (the Buddha), and then point out the difference between the ideal and the other religious who are deficient in their conduct. This is important since the conduct of the ideal recluse as defined in the short moralities becomes the foundation for Buddhist ethics.[9]

4 Ajātasattu

The rajah Ajāta,sattu (r ca 491-459 BCE) is mentioned at the start of **the Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16) as planning to conquer the Vajjī republic, and he sends his minister, Vassa,kāra, to the Buddha to hear his counsel. Ajāta,sattu is the patricide king who, 7 years before the Buddha's parinirvana, has imprisoned and executed his own father, Bimbisāra,[10] though the latter has, at the age of 65, after 52 or so years of rule (around 491 or 493 BCE), had abdicated in his favour. **The Sāmaññ a,phala Sutta** (D 2) relates how the troubled king Ajātasattu goes to meet the Buddha and has a lengthy and uplifting dialogue with the Buddha.[11]

Ajāta,sattu is often given the epithet of **Vedehi,putta**. According to Buddhaghosa,[12] Vedehi here refers to *videhī*, meaning a wise woman and not the "Videha lady," because Ajātasattu's mother was the daughter, not of a king of Videha, but of a king of Kosala.[13] According to the Nirayā,valī Sūtra,[14] one of Bimbisāra's wives was Callanā, the daughter of Ceṭaka, a rajah of Vaiśālī, whose sister sister Triśālā was the mother of Mahā,vīra. She was also called Śrī,bhadrā. The Tibetan Vinaya (Dulvā)[15] says that Ajātasattu's mother was Vāsavī, daughter of Siṁha of Vaiśālī. It was foretold that Vāsavī's son would kill his own father.

When the child was born, Bimbisāra, however, showed him the greatest affection. The prince was nicknamed **"Ajāta,sattu**" because soothsayers had predicted of his enmity against his own father even before his birth, that is, he is the "unborn" (*ajāta*) enemy (*sattu*). A more generous etymology, however, is one meaning that he would have no enemies.[16] According to Tārānātha, the 16th century Tibetan Buddhist historian, his personal name was **Kṣema,darśin** (P *Khema,dassī) (*Indian Historical Quarterly*, 3:508).[17]

5 Ajāta,sattu's inability to recognize the Buddha

The Sāmaññ a,phala Sutta relates how when Ajāta,sattu arrives at Jīvaka's mango grove he is unable to recognize the Buddha, asking, "Where, brother Jīvaka, is the Blessed One?" [11]. Neither the Pali sutta nor its other versions (Sanskrit texts, Āgama in Chinese translations, etc) gives any hint of how the Buddha and the monks were seated. The Pali sutta merely says that the Buddha was "sitting against the middle pillar, facing the east, before the community of monks" (*majjhimaṁ thambhaṁ nissāya puratthâbhimukho nisinno purakkhato bhikkhu,saṅghassâ ti*) [11].

It is rather curious that Ajāta,sattu is unable to recognize the Buddha despite his sitting in such a prominent position. But it is not difficult to explain the reasons for this. Firstly, there are 1250 monks present, and even if the Buddha was sitting before them, it would be difficult to at once notice the Buddha

---

[9] See Damien Keown 1992:29-32.
[10] V 2:188-192.
[11] D 2/1:47-86.
[12] *Vedehi,putto ti vedehī ti paṇḍitâdhivacanaṁ etaṁ, paṇḍit'itthiyā putto ti attho* (SA 1:154; cf DA 1:139).
[13] Eg J 3:121, 4:342. She was called Kosala,devī at J 2:403.
[14] Jacobi, *Jaina Sutras,* SBE 22, Intro p xiii.
[15] Rockhill, *Life of the Buddha*, 63 f.
[16] DA 1:133 ff.; J 3:121 f.; D:RD 2:78 f.
[17] For details, see Piya Tan, *The Buddha and His Disciples* (2004) ch 8 "The Thundering Silence" §3-8.

from the blaze of saffron robes. After all, Ajāta,sattu is standing at the gate of the pavilion, some distance away from the congregation.

Secondly, Ajāta,sattu suffers psychological blindness: perhaps on account of his guilt (having killed his own father, and also having attempted to assassinate the Buddha himself on Devadatta's instigation).[18] As such, even though the Buddha is within his visual range, his mind somehow is unwilling or unable to see him: he looks at the Buddha but does not see him.

Thirdly, the sutta reciters present this account in such a manner to show Ajāta,sattu's spiritual blindness, shown in his profound guilt and low spirits. The peace and beauty of the moonlit night only reminds Ajāta,sattu what he lacks:

> How wonderful is this moonlit night! How beautiful! How lovely! How inspiring! How auspicious! What brahmin or recluse should we visit tonight who might brighten our heart [with faith and peace]? [§1]

Like Shakespeare's King Lear, who is blind to the true meaning of love, and only really "sees" after he becomes blind, Ajāta,sattu has been blind ever since he falls under the power of Devadatta. Only at the end of the Sāmaññ,phala sutta do we see Ajāta,sattu truly seeing himself. This, of course, with the help of the Great Seer himself.

___ ___ ___

[18] These events are said to have occurred 8 years before the Buddha's final nirvana (V 2:184-197, 3:171 f, 174 f, 4:171; A 3:123, 402, 2:73, 4:160; Ap 2:300 f; DhA 1:112 f, 3:154; J 1:86, 113, 142, 185, 490, 508, 4:37, 158, 5:333 ff, 6:129 f). Cf **Sañjīva J** (J 1:510 f) which says that in past lives he had associated with evil people and once lost his life as a result.

The Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship

(D 2/1:47-86)

Introduction

[47] 1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying in Jīvaka Komāra,bhacca's[19] mango grove near Rājagaha, with a large community of monks, 1,250 monks in all.

Now at that time—it being the observance day,[20] the full-moon night of Komudī [the water-lily season],[21] the month of Kattikā [the 4th month][22] of the rains—the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha,[23] was sitting on the roof terrace of his palace surrounded by his ministers.

Then he felt inspired to exclaim: "How wonderful is this moonlit night! How beautiful! How lovely! How inspiring! How auspicious! What brahmin or recluse should we visit tonight who might brighten our heart [with faith and peace]?"[24]

THE THREE KINDS OF SILENCE

The ministers & Ajātasattu's silence

2 When this was said, one of the ministers said to the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, "Your majesty,[25] there is **Pūraṇa Kassapa**, who is accomplished as the head of an order, head of a group [congregation], congregation teacher, well known and famous, ford-maker [who brings one across the river of suffering], esteemed as good by the masses, one of great experience, long gone forth, advanced in years.[26] Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps, then he would enlighten and bring you peace of mind."

When this was said, however, the rajah remained silent.

3 Then another minister said to the rajah…, "Your majesty, there is **[48] Makkhali Gosāla**…"

The rajah, however, remained silent.

4 Then another minister said to the rajah…, "Your majesty, there is **Ajita Kesa,kambala…"**

The rajah, however, remained silent.

5 Then another minister said to the rajah…, "Your majesty, there is **Pakudha Kaccāyāna**…"

The rajah, however, remained silent.

6 Then another minister said to the rajah…, "Your majesty, there is **Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta**…"

---

[19] The royal physician. See **Jīvaka S** (M 55) on meat-eating.

[20] *uposatha* (Skt *upavasatha*): orig a Brahmin fast-day. On the suggestion of the late rajah Bimbisāra, the Buddha introduced the *uposatha* as a fortnightly day of confession for Sangha members (V 1:101-104).

[21] Called after the white water-lily (*kumuda*, cf Dh 285) which blooms at that time.

[22] *Kattikā* (Skt *Kṛttikā*, BHS *karthika*, the Pleiades): mid-October to mid-November, that is, just after the rains retreat.

[23] "The rajah of Magadha, Ajāta,sattu Vedehi,putta," *rājā Māgadho Ajātasattu Vedehi,putto,*alt tr "the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta the Magadhī" or "the rajah of the Magadhī, Ajātasattu Vedehiputta," Ajātasattu is called *vedehi,putta* (Skt Vaidehi,putra) because his mother (a queen is from Videha, whose capital is Mithilā. For details, see Piya Tan, *The Buddha and His Disciples* (2004) ch 8 "The Thundering Silence" §3-9. Ajātasattu reigned ca. 491-459 BCE. On the instigation of Devadatta, he killed his own father, Bimbisāra, to gain the throne. (See D:W 567 n365)

[24] *Kaṁ nu kh'ajja samaṇaṁ va brahmanaṁ vā payirupāseyyāma, yaṁ no payirupāsato cittaṁ pasīdeyyâ ti.* This sentence is in the royal plural. Ajātasattu is troubled by his patricide.

[25] *Deva*, voc, lit "god", here used in a conventional sense. Notice that Jīvaka, the six teachers and the Buddha address Ajātasattu as *mahārāja*, "great rajah," against convention. See §12, §40n on *deva*.

[26] "Who is accomplished…etc…advanced in years," *saṅghī c'eva gaṇī ca gaṇ'ācariyo ca ñāto yasassī tittha-karo sādhu,sammato bahu,janassa rattaññū cira,pabbajito addha,gato vayo anuppatto* (D 2.2/1:47). Similar stock passage at D 16.5.26/2:150.

The rajah. however, remained silent.

7 Then another minister said to the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, "Your majesty, there is **[49] Nigaṇṭha Naṭaputta,** who is accomplished as the head of an order, head of a group [congregation], congregation teacher, well known and famous, ford-maker [who brings one across the river of suffering], esteemed as good by the masses, one of great experience, long gone forth, advanced in years. Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps, then he would might brighten your majesty's heart [with faith and peace]."[27]

The rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, however, remained silent.

Jīvaka Komāra,bhacca's silence

8 All this time Jīvaka Komāra,bhacca was sitting silently not far from the rajah. So the rajah said to him, "Brother Jīvaka, why are you silent?"

"Your majesty, there is the Blessed One, the Arhat [worthy], the fully self-awakened one, staying in my mango grove with a large community of monks, 1250 monks in all. About the Blessed One, this good report has been spread about, thus:[28]

'The Blessed One is an arhat, the fully self-awakened one, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-gone, knower of the worlds,[29] unexcelled trainer of tamable people, teacher of beings human and divine, awakened, blessed.'

Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps then he would brighten your majesty's heart [with faith and peace]."

"In that case, brother Jīvaka, have the riding elephants prepared."

9 "As you say, your majesty," replied Jīvaka and having had five hundred female elephants and the rajah's personal tusker prepared, Jīvaka announced to him:

"Your majesty, your riding elephants are prepared. Please do as your majesty please."[30]

The noble silence

10 Then the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha had the five hundred of his women mounted on the five hundred female elephants, one on each, and he mounted his own personal tusker. They set out from the capital in full royal state, with attendants carrying torches, heading for Jīvaka Komārabhacca's mango grove.

When the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, was not far from the mango grove, however, he was gripped **[50]** with a terrible fear and trembling, his hair standing on ends. Then the terrified the rajah

---

[27] Note the sequence of teachers' names here, and compare with sequence in §28-33.

[28] *Evaṁ kalyāṇo kitti,saddo abbhuggato:* **V 1**:35; **D 1**:49, 116, 236, **2**:317; **M 1**:285, **2**:167; **S 5**:352; **A 1**:180, **3**:58, **4**:80 (*kalyāṇo…abbhuggaccheyya*); **Sn** p103; **J 1**:509.

[29] *Loka,vidū.* Thānissaro: "an expert with regard to the cosmos." "Worlds" here as *bhava* refers to the Sense World, the Form World, and the Formless World (D 3:215 M 1:294). In the Comys, it refers to the human world, the deva realm and the Brahmā realm (DA 1:173 MA 1:397), or to the world of formations (*saṅkhāra,loka*), the world of beings (*satta,loka*) and the physical universe (*okāsa,loka*) (Vism 204 DA 1:173 MA 1:397). On the 6 senses as the "world," see **(Lujjati) Loka S** (S 35.83/4:52 f) = SD 7.3. See also **Lok'anta Gamana S 1** (S 35.116/4:93-97) = SD 7.4 & **(Samuday'atthaṅgama) Loka S** (S 12.44/2:71-73) = SD 7.4.

[30] *Yassa dāni tvaṁ kālaṁ maññasî ti,* lit "Do what you think it is now the time to do." This is stock; see: **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.6/2:104 = SD 13), **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.101/1:85 = SD 8.10), **Kaṇṇaka-t,thala S** (M 90.17/2:132 f = SD 10.8), **Puṇṇ'ovāda S** (M 145.6/3:269 = S 35.88/4:62,31) = SD 14.13, **Avassuta S** (S 35.243/-4:183,15, 30), **Khemā Therī S** (S 44.1/4:379,29), **Vesālī S** (S 54.9/5:321,16, 17) & **Thapatayā S** (S 55.6/5:348,27). See Joy Manné, "On a departure formula and its translation," *Buddhist Studies Review* 10, 1993:27-43.

Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, whose hair was standing on ends, awe-struck,[31] said this to Jīvaka Komārabhacca:

"Brother Jīvaka, you aren't deceiving me, are you? You aren't betraying me, are you? You aren't turning me over to my enemies, are you? How can there be such a large community of monks, 1250 in all, without any sound of sneezing, without any sound of coughing, without any voice at all?"[32]

"Fear not, maharajah. Fear not. I'm not deceiving you nor betraying you nor turning you over to your enemies. Go ahead, maharajah, go ahead! Those are lamps burning in the pavilion hall."[33]

MEETING OF THE TWO KINGS

Ajātasattu does not recognize the Buddha

11 Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, went on his tusker as far as the ground would permit, dismounted and went up to the gate of the pavilion on foot. Then he asked,

"Where, brother Jīvaka, is the Blessed One?"[34]

"That is the Blessed One, maharajah. That is the Blessed One, maharajah, sitting against the middle pillar, facing the east,[35] before the community of monks."

Udāyi,bhadda

12 Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, approached the Blessed One and then stood at one side. Surveying the community of monks sitting in absolute silence, as calm as a lake, he felt inspired to exclaim: "If only my son, Prince Udāyi,bhadda,[36] were to enjoy the same peace that this community of monks now enjoys!"

[The Blessed One said:] "Maharajah, are you thinking of the one you love?"[37]

---

[31] "Awe-struck," *saṁviggo,* in other contexts, "stirred with religious emotion." Here the word reflects his guilt and fear. The noun *saṁvega* is also used in a positive sense to refer to strong religious inspiration (D 2:140; A 1:36, 2:120; It 30)

[32] Dh Comy gives a graphic description of such a scene: "Now the moment the Supremely Awakened One arrived, the Congregation of Monks ceased their talk, became silent. The Teacher surveyed the assemblage with soft, kind heart and said, 'This assemblage delights my heart beyond measure. Not a single hand is out of place, not a single foot is out of place; not a cough is to be heard, not a sneeze is to be heard; all these monks, reverent with reverence for the Buddha, subdued by the majesty of the Buddha, though I were to sit here for an aeon and not speak, would refrain from speaking first, would not so much as open their lips. I alone have the right to decide when it is proper to begin to speak. Therefore I will speak first.'" (DhA 1:249 f). This may be Commentarial hyperbole, but despite their personal discipline, the monks show deep spiritual friendship for one another, "blending like milk and water" and regularly "smiling and cheerful", all of which profoundly delighted king Pasenadi as recorded in Dhamma,cetiya S. (M 89.11-12/2:121). Pasenadi was similarly impressed by the monks' noble silence (M 89.13/ 2:121 f). See also the Mahā Sakul'udāyi S, where several hundreds of monks would anticipate in silence for the Buddha to speak, thinking, "Let us hear the Dharma the Blessed One is about to speak!" (M 77.6/2:5 f).

[33] "Pavilion-hall," *maṇḍala,māḷa,* "a circular hall with a peaked roof, a pavilion" (D 1:2, 50; Sn p104; Miln 16).

[34] On Ajāta,sattu's inability to recognize the Buddha, see Intro (5) above.

[35] "Facing the east." The Shāmēnguŏ Jīng (沙 門 果 經) in the Chinese Āgama (T1 = 27.1.108a6) tr Buddhayaṣas (413 CE) reads: nan mian er zuo, "sitting facing the south" [MacQueen 1988:36]. Graeme MacQueen explains that "…in China, the Emperor is always made to face South; indeed, the phrase 'to sit facing South' (南 面 而 坐 nán miàn ér zuò) [T 1: 27.1.108a6] used in [Buddhayaśas' tr] has in Chinese the meaning of 'to reign as Emperor'." (1988:142); cf 坐 北 朝 南 zuò běi cháo nán. This is a good example of translating the sense rather than the letter for the benefit of the local audience.

[36] The son who is eventually to kill Ajātasattu himself, only in turn to be murdered by *his* son. The dynasty ended when the masses became disgusted with this destructive tendency.

[37] *Agamā kho tvaṁ mahā,rāja yathā peman ti,* where *agamā* (Sn 408, 976; Vv 79,7) is 3rd aor of *gacchati* (he goes); lit "Have you gone, maharajah, where love (is)?" Walshe: "Do your thoughts go to the one you love, Your Majesty?" Bodhi: "Do your thoughts, great king, follow the call of your affection?" Ṭhānissaro: "Have you come, maharajah, together with your affections?" Comy says that the Buddha, having read Ajāta,sattu's mind, notices that

"Bhante, my son, Prince Udāyi,bhadda, is very dear to me. If only he were to enjoy the same peace that this community of monks now enjoys!"

The rajah's opening question

13 Then, bowing down to the Blessed One, and saluting the community of monks with **[51]** palms together, he sat down at one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One: "I would like to ask the Blessed One about a certain matter, if he would be kind enough to answer my question."

"Ask, maharajah, whatever you like."

14 "Bhante, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers, horse-trainers, charioteers, archers, standard bearers, camp marshals, supply corps officers, high royal officers, front-line soldiers, bull-warriors, military heroes, armour-clad warriors, leather-clad warriors, domestic slaves, confectioners, barbers, bath attendants, cooks, garland-makers, laundrymen, weavers, basket-makers, potters, calculators, accountants, and any other craftsmen of a similar sort.

They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible here and now. They thus find happiness and give happiness to their parents, wives, and children, to their friends and colleagues. They make excellent offerings to recluses and brahmins, resulting in happiness, conducive to a heavenly rebirth.

"**Is it possible, bhante, to point out a similar fruit of the recluseship, visible here and now (*sandiṭṭhika*)?**" [= §33]

The Buddha's counter-question

15 "Do you remember, maharajah, ever having asked this question of other brahmins or recluses?"

"Yes, I do, bhante."

"If it isn't troublesome for you, how did they answer?"

"No, bhante, it's not troublesome for me if it were someone like the Blessed One." **[52]**

"Well then, maharajah, tell me."

§16-33 THE SIX SECTARIAN TEACHERS[38]

(1) Pūraṇa Kassapa [*akiriyā,vāda,* antinomian ethics: non-action & amoralism]

16 "Once, bhante, I approached **Pūraṇa Kassapa**.[39] After an exchange of courtesies, I sat down at one side. Then I asked him: 'Master Kassapa, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*. They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible here and now.

Is it possible, bhante, to point out a similar fruit of recluseship, visible here and now?'[40]

17a[41] Purāṇa Kassapa, bhante, said to me,

'Maharajah, when one does or makes another do, such deeds as cutting others, burning others, or hurting others, tormenting others, intimidating others, killing, stealing, breaking into houses, plundering, burgling, ambushing, committing adultery, lying, one does no evil.

If with a razor-disc [chakra] (*cakka*), one were to turn all the living beings on this earth to a single mountain of flesh, no evil would come from it.

---

he was unable to converse with him (the Buddha), and that the guilt of killing his father, Bimbisāra, the Buddha's chief lay support, weighs heavy on his mind. As such, the Buddha makes this remark to put Ajāta,sattu at ease (DA 1:153 f).

[38] For a summary on the 6 teachers, see **Kutūhala S** (S 44.9) = SD 23.15 Intro (2).

[39] (Skt) Pūraṇa Kāśyapa. Died ca 484 or 503 BCE. He was an Ājīvika or naked ascetic (see, eg, V 1:291 M 1:238 S 1:66): §18 n on Ājīvikas. Pūraṇa's views are refuted in **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.13-20/1:404-407) = SD 35.5, **Karota S** (S 24.6/3:208 f) = SD 23.10, & **Hetu S** (S 24.7/3:210 f) = SD 23.6. See DPPN: Ājīvakā; also Jayatilleke 1963:143-145 (see index) & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

[40] See §34.

[41] From here on, I break off from the PTS numbering and follow Bodhi's (1989:20 ff) for the sake of easy reference. See §46 n.

If one were to go along the south bank of the Ganges, killing and making others kill, mutilating and making others mutilate, torturing and making others torture, there is no evil, no source of evil.

Or, if one were to go along the north bank of the Ganges, giving and making others give, sacrificing and making others sacrifice, there is no merit, no source of merit. **[53]**

In generosity, self-taming, self-restraint, and truthful speech, there is no merit, no source of merit.'[42]

Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Purāṇa Kassapa answered with non-action.

Just as if a person, bhante, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango—in the same way, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Purāṇa Kassapa answered with non-action.

17b The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.'[43] So I neither delighted in Purāṇa Kassapa's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, I rose and left.

(2) Makkhali Gosāla [*ahetuka,vāda,* fatalism or determinism: denial of causality]

18 At another time, bhante, I approached Makkhali Gosāla.[44] After an exchange of courtesies, I sat down at one side. Then I asked him: 'Master Gosāla, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*, *asking the same question*.

19 Makkhali Gosāla, bhante, said to me,

'Maharajah, there is neither cause nor condition[45] for the defilement of beings.

Beings are defiled without cause, without condition.

There is neither cause nor condition for the purification of beings.

Beings are purified without cause, without condition.

There is nothing self-caused, nothing other-caused, nothing human-caused.[46]

There is no power, no effort, no personal strength [human energy], human endeavour.

All living beings, all life, all beings, all souls (*jīva*) are powerless, devoid of power, devoid of effort.

Subject to the changes of fate, circumstances and nature, they experience pleasure and pain in the six classes by birth.[47] **[54]**

---

[42] See **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.13-20 = 1:404-407) where this view of Purāṇa's is refuted. See Bodhi, *The Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship,* 1989:69 f.

[43] *Kathaṁ hi nāma m'ādiso samaṇaṁ vā brāhmaṇaṁ vā vijite vasantaṁ apasādetabbaṁ maññeyyâ ti.* Comy glosses *vijite* as *āṇā,pavatti,dese* ("in the land under one's sway"); and *apasādetabba* as *viheṭhetabba* ("should be vexed by"). On *apasādetabbaṁ maññeyya,* cf **Cīvara S** (S 16.11) where the nun Thulla,nandā tells Ānanda how she harbours displeasure (*apasādetabbaṁ maññati*) towards Mahā Kassapa for chiding Ānanda (S 16.11.11/2:219). Here, Ajāta,sattu makes this remark probably owing to his bad conscience; but the remark also suggests the enormous (and not always deserved) respect in which such wandering teachers were held. (Walshe)

[44] (Skt) Maskarin Gośāla or Gośālī,putra. Founding leader of the **Ājīvikas**, anti-brahmanical community whose pessimistic doctrines are related to those of Jainism. Gosāla was believed to be a friend of Mahavira, the founder of Jainism. Gosāla denied that a man's actions could influence rebirth, which occurred according to a rigid pattern, controlled in every way by "destiny" (*niyati*). After a period of prosperity under Asoka, the sect rapidly declined and only retained local importance in SE India, where it survived until the 14th cent. The name ***ājīvika,*** given to the sect by their opponents, is derived from *ājīva*, here meaning livelihood appropriate to one's class. Gosala, however, held that a mendicant's *ājīva* was not affected by karma. Furthermore, since Gosāla was an ascetic not for reasons of salvation, but as a livelihood (*ājīva*)—they were professionals—the name was clearly opprobrious. See AL Basham, 1951:224-239 (chs 12-13); D:W 544 nn102-109; Bodhi, 1989:69 f. Makkhali's view is refuted in **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.21-28/1:407-411). See Jayatilleke, 1963:143-145, 152-154, 157-159 (see index) & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

[45] *Ahetu,appaccayā*: "condition," *hetu,* means "root" (eg greed, hatred, delusion); *paccaya* means "condition."

[46] The ideas here and in the next para are presented by a certain Brahmin to the Buddha who refutes them in **Atta,kārī S** (A 6.38/3:337 f) = SD 7.6.

[47] *Niyati,saṅgati,bhāva,pariṇatā chass'ev'ābhijātisu sukha,dukkhaṁ paṭisaṁvedeti.* See **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.21-28/1:407-410 = SD 35.5) & **Sandaka S** (M 76.13-14/1:516 f), where this wrong view is refuted. On these 6 "classes

There are 1,406,600 principal modes of origin. There are 500 kinds of karma,[48] five kinds of karma,[49] and three kinds of karma;[50] full karma and half karma.[51] There are 62 pathways, 62 sub-aeons, six classes by birth, eight classes of men, 4,900 modes of livelihood, 4,900 kinds of wanderers, 4,900 Naga-abodes, 2,000 faculties, 3,000 hells, 36 dust-realms, seven spheres of percipient beings, seven spheres of non-percipient [unconscious] beings, seven kinds of being "freed from bonds,"[52] seven kinds of deities, seven kinds of human beings, seven kinds of demons, seven great lakes, seven major knots, seven minor knots, seven (major) precipices, 700 precipices, seven (major) dreams, 700 dreams, 84,000 great aeons.

Having transmigrated[53] and wandered on through these, the wise and the foolish alike will put an end to pain.

Though one might think, "Through this moral conduct, this practice, this austerity, or this holy life I will ripen unripened karma and eliminate ripened karma that has arisen"—that is impossible.

Pleasure and pain are measured out by the bushel. Samsara (cycle of life and death) is fixed in its limits**,** with neither shortening nor lengthening, neither excess nor deficit.

Just as a ball of string, when thrown, comes to its end simply by unwinding, in the same way, having transmigrated and wandered on, the wise and the foolish alike will put an end to pain.'

20 Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Makkhali Gosāla answered with purification through the wandering-on (*saṃsāra,suddhi*)**.**

The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.' **[55]** So I neither delighted in Makkhali Gosāla's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, I rose and left.

(3) Ajita Kesa,kambala [Materialism: Annihilation]

21 At another time, bhante, I approached **Ajita Kesa.kambala.**[54] Then I asked him: 'Master Ajita, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*, *asking the same question*.

22 Ajita Kesakambala, bhante, said to me,

'Maharajah**,** there is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed.

There is no fruit or result of good or evil actions.

There is no this world, no next world.[55]

---

by birth" (*ābhijāti*), see **Cha-ḷ-ābhijāti S** (A 6./3:383 = SD 23.10), where according to the antinomian Pūraṇa Kassapa, they are (1) the black class (*kaṇhābhijāti*), ie the bloody trade (butchers, fishermen, robbers, etc); (2) the blue class (*nīlâbhijāti*), ie monks who subscribe to karma; (3) the red class (*lohitâbhijāti*), ie the loin-clad Jains; (4) the yellow class (*haliddâbhijāti*), ie the white-clad disciples of naked ascetics; (5) the white class (*sukkâbhijāti*), ie the male and female Ājīvikas; (6) the purest white class (*parama,sukkhābhijāti*), ie Nanda Vaccha, Kisa Saṅkicca and Makkhali Gosāla. The Buddha however rejects this arbitrary gesture, and teaches that it is karma that makes us, not class (A 6.57/3:383-387; also DA 1:182; MA 3:131; AA 2:342 f; SA 2:342 f). See also **Deva,daha S** (M 101.22-(4)/2:222 = SD 18.4), where *ābhijāti* is mentioned in connection with the Nirgranthas, and Bodhi, *Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship*, 1989: 73-75.

[48] Karma, here in a non-Buddhist sense.

[49] According to the 5 physical senses.

[50] Of thought, word and deed.

[51] "Half-karma", in thought only.

[52] *Nigaṇṭhi,gabbhā*: "rebirths as a Nigraṇṭha." See §28n.

[53] *sandhāvitvā,* "having transmigrated" (fr. *sandhāvati*). This term which connotes a permanent soul is not used in Buddhism.

[54] (Skt) Ajita Keśa,kambala. *Kesa,kambala*, of the hair-blanket. He wore a cloak of human hair and was a materialist. His view is refuted in **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.5-12 = 1:401-404) = SD 35.5. See Jayatilleke 1963:94, 98 f & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

[55] "There is no this world, no next world," *n'atthi ayaṁ loko, n'atthi para,loko,* lit "this world does not exist, the next world does not exist" (D 3:265, 287; M 1:286, 401, 515 (bis), 3:22, 52, 71; S 3:204, 348, 355, 351 (bis); A 1:269, 4:226, 5:265, 284; Nc:Be 276). While the Lokāyata materialists may be known to deny the next world, it is difficult to understand why they should deny the existence of this world as well. However, the problem is solved

There is no mother, no father.

There are no spontaneously born beings.[56]

There are no recluses and brahmins who, living rightly and practising rightly, having directly known and realized for themselves this world and the hereafter, proclaim them.'[57]

'A person is a composite of the four primary elements. At death, the earth (in the body) returns to and merges with the (external) earth-substance. The fire returns to and merges with the external fire-substance. The liquid returns to and merges with the external liquid-substance. The wind returns to and merges with the external wind-substance. The sense-faculties scatter into space.

Four men, with the bier as the fifth, carry the corpse. His eulogies are sounded only as far as the charnel ground. The bones turn pigeon-colored. The offerings end in ashes.

Generosity is taught by fools. The words of those who speak of existence after death are false, empty chatter.

With the break-up of the body, the wise and the foolish alike are annihilated, destroyed. They do not exist after death.'

23 Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Ajita Kesakambala answered with annihilation.

The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.' So I neither delighted in Ajita Kesakambala's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, **[56]** I rose and left.

(4) Pakudha Kaccāyana [Atomism: Non-relatedness; forerunner of Vaiśeṣika]

24 At another time, bhante, I approached **Pakudha Kaccāyana.**[58] Then I asked him: 'Master Kaccāyana, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*, *asking the same question*.

25 Pakudha Kaccāyana, bhante, said to me,

'Maharajah, there are these seven substances [or "bodies," *kāya*]**,** uncreated, irreducible, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar, that do not obstruct with one another, are incapable of causing one another happiness, pain or both happiness and pain.

Which seven? The earth-substance, the liquid-substance, the fire-substance, the wind-substance, happiness, pain, and the soul as the seventh. These are the seven substances.

And among them there is no killer nor one who causes killing, no hearer nor one who causes hearing, no knower nor one who causes knowing. When one cuts off a (person's) head, there is no one taking anyone's life. The sword simply passes through the seven substances.' **[57]**

26 Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Pakudha Kaccāyana answered in an irrelevant way.

---

when one examines the only extant authentic Lokāyata text, Tattvopaplava-Siṁha (ed Saṅghavi & Parekh, Gaekwad Oriental Series 87, Baroda, 1940), by Jayarāśi Bhaṭṭa, a devoted Bṛhaspati adherent of the 8th century CE. According to this work, there was a Lokāyata materialist school that denied the existence of this world as well. While the pluralistic school of metaphysical materialists believed in the reality of the primary elements and denied only the next world, the nihilist school of pragmatic materialists denied the reality of both this world and the next. Basically, the latter asserted that our perception is always false. "Was Ajita also a pragmatist Materialist like Jayarāśi? The more probable explanation seems to be that the Buddhists identified all the known materialist views with Ajita, who symbolizes the philosophy of Materialism, inconsistently putting together the tenets of mutually opposed schools since they both (or all) happened to be in some sense (metaphysical or pragmatic) materialists" (Jayatilleke 1963:91; also 79 f, 92).

[56] *opapātika*, said of the rebirth of a non-returner, but also refers to all divine and hell beings. See **Mahāli S** (D 1:27 156).

[57] Also occurs at **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41.10/1:287) = SD 5.7 & **Sandaka S** (M 76.7/1:515) = SD 35.7. See **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.5-12/1:401-404) = SD 35.5 where this wrong view is refuted.

[58] (Skt) Kakudha Kātyāyana. Also known as Pakudhaka Kātiyāna. Holds an atomic theory. On Pakudha Kaccāyana, see Jayatilleke 1963:265-268 (see index) & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.' So I neither delighted in Pakudha Kaccāyāna's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, I rose and left.

(5) Nigaṇṭha Naṭa,putta [Fourfold restraint]

27 At another time, bhante, I approached **Nigaṇṭha Naṭaputta.**[59] Then I asked him: 'Master Aggi,-vessana,[60] there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*, *asking the same question*.

28 Nigaṇṭha Naṭaputta, bhante, said to me,

'Maharajah, there is the case where the Nigaṇṭha,[61] the knotless one, is restrained by the fourfold restraint, that is so say, where the Nigaṇṭha is obstructed by all the waters, conjoined with all the waters, cleansed by all the waters, suffused with all the waters [ie the avoidance of all evil].[62]

This is how the Nigaṇṭha is restrained with the fourfold restraint. When the Nigaṇṭha is restrained with such a fourfold restraint, he is said to be a "knotless one" (*nigaṇṭha*), with his self perfected, his self controlled, his self established.' **[58]**

29 Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Nigaṇṭha Naṭaputta answered with fourfold restraint.

The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.' So I neither delighted in Nigaṇṭha Naṭaputta's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, I rose and left.

(6) Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta [Agnosticism, skepticism & evasion]

30 At another time, bhante, I approached **Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta**.[63] After an exchange of courtesies, I sat down on one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Master Sañjaya, there are these common craftsmen like elephant-trainers *and so on*. They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible here and now. Is it possible, bhante, to point out a similar fruit of recluseship, visible here and now?'

31 Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta, bhante, said to me,

(A) 1. 'If you were to ask me whether there is a world beyond [a hereafter], if I thought that it exists, I would declare to you, "It is so." But I do not say it is this. I do not say it is that. I do not say it is otherwise. I do not say it is not so. I do not say it is not not so.

2. …whether there is no world beyond…

3. ...whether there both is and is not a world beyond …

---

[59] (Skt) Nirgrantha Jñāti,putra. The name given in the Pali Canon to Vardhamāna Mahāvīra (ca. 540-568 BCE?), the leader of the Jains. He is several times unfavourably referred to in the Canon, eg Upāli S (M 56). *Nigaṇṭha* means "free from bonds." On Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta, see Jayatilleke 1963:140 f (see index) & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

[60] On the name Aggi,vessana, see **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74) = SD 14.1 Intro (1).

[61] Skt *nirgraṇṭha,* "one free of knots," ie liberated from defilements.

[62] *sabba,vāri,vārito, sabba,vāri,yuto, sabba,vāri,dhuto, sabba,vāri,phuṭṭo* (with some variant readings), which do not represent the genuine Jain teaching, but seem to parody it in puns. The Jains do have a rule of restraint in regard to water, and *vāri* can mean "water", "restraint" or possibly "sin", and some of the verbal forms are equally dubious. The reference to one "free from bonds" and yet bound by these restraints (whatever they are) is a deliberate paradox. (KR Norman in Walshe 1996:545 n115)

[63] (Skt) Saṁjayin Vairaṭṭī,putra. Also called (P) Belaṭṭhi,putta. Although he is put in unfavourable light in the Pali texts, we should not disregard the possibility that there is a serious note to his philosophy. It is likely that his standpoint is not made out of ignorance but based on the notion that knowledge was not necessary, even dangerous for salvation. In other words, when one really knows nothing, one then realizes everything. Shosun Miyamoto, in his article "The logic of relativity as the common ground for the development of the middle way" (in Yamaguchi, 1960: 67-88) asserts that Sañjaya's "system is quite near to the Buddhist standpoint of [the] indescribable or inexpressible [*avyākata*]" and that "Sañjaya's thought is not far removed from the logic of *Śūnya* of the Mādhyamika." For a study of Sañjaya as a skeptic, see Jayatilleke 1963:130-135, 336-339 (see index) & Jaini (1970) 2001:57-61.

4. ...whether there neither is nor is not a world beyond...

(B) 1. ...whether there are spontaneously-born beings.
2. ...whether there no spontaneously-born beings.
3. ...whether there both are and are not spontaneously-born beings.
4. ...whether there neither are nor are not spontaneously-born beings.

(C) 1. …whether good and evil actions have fruit and result…
2. …whether good and evil actions have no fruit and result…
3. …whether good and evil actions both have and have not fruit and result…
4. …whether good and evil actions neither have nor have not fruit and result…[64]

(D) 1. ...whether the Tathāgata [one thus-come] **[59]** exists after death…
2. ...whether the Tathāgata does not exist after death…
3. …whether the Tathāgata both exists and does not exist after death…
4. ...whether the Tathāgata neither exists nor not exists after death…,

I would declare to you, "It is so." But I do not say it is this. I do not say it is that. I do not say it is otherwise. I do not say it is not so. I do not say it is not not so.'

32 Thus, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta answered with **evasion**. Just as if a person, bhante, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, bhante, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango, in the same way, bhante, when asked about a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta answered with evasion.

Bhante, the thought occurred to me: 'Of all these recluses and brahmins, Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta is the most foolish of all, the most confused of all.[65]

The thought, bhante, occurred to me: 'Someone like me should not think to be faithless [dismissive] of a recluse or a brahmin living in his realm.' So I neither delighted in Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta's words nor protested against them, but I was dissatisfied. However, bhante, neither showing dissatisfaction nor accepting his teaching, I rose and left.

THE FIRST VISIBLE FRUIT OF RECLUSESHIP

Ajātasattu questions the Buddha

33 So, bhante, I (now) ask the Blessed One as well: There are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers *and so on*. They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible here and now. **[60]**

Is it possible, bhante, to point out a similar fruit of recluseship, visible here and now?"[66]

34a "Yes, it is, maharajah. But first, with regard to that, I will ask you a question in return. Answer, maharajah, as your majesty pleases.

Respect for renunciants 1 [§34-36]

34b What do you think, maharajah? Suppose you have a slave, your workman, rising in the morning before you, going to bed in the evening only after you, doing whatever you order, always acting to please you, speaking politely to you, always watching for the look on your face.[67] He might think:

'Isn't the results of merit[68] amazing! For this rajah of Magadha, Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta, is a human being, and I, too, am a human being, yet the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha enjoys himself

---

[64] These whole section omitted by Ṭhānissaro.

[65] *Ayañ ca imesaṁ samaṇa,brāhmaṇānaṁ sabba,bālo sabba,mūḷho*. This sentence is often missed out by most translators who repeat the *peyyāla* (stock passage) for the previous 5 teachers. See MacQueen 1988:147 f.

[66] This question as at §16, the answer ends in §36.

[67] That is, to be alert to his needs and instructions, and to be sure that he is satisfied.

[68] Merit (*puñña*) does not lead to awakening, but to temporary future happiness in this world or another. Popular Buddhism and business Buddhism as a rule focus on merit-making.

supplied and replete with the five cords of sensual pleasures[69]—like a god, as it were—while I am his slave, his workman, always watching for the look on his face. I, too, then should do deeds of merit. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

So after some time he shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness. Having thus gone forth he lives restrained in body, speech, and mind, content with the simplest food and shelter, delighting in solitude.

Then suppose one of your men were to inform you that this slave, your workman, has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, would you, thus informed, say,

'Bring that man back to me. Make him again my slave, my workman!'?" **[61]**

35 "Not at all, bhante. Rather, I am the one who should bow down to him, rise up out of respect for him, invite him to a seat, invite him to accept gifts of robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicinal requisites for the sick. And I would provide him with righteous safety, defence, and protection."

36 "So what do you think, maharajah? That being the case, is there a visible fruit of recluseship, or is there not?"

"Yes, bhante. That being the case, there certainly is a visible fruit of recluseship."

"This, maharajah, is **the first fruit of recluseship**, visible here and now, that I point out to you."

THE SECOND VISIBLE FRUIT OF RECLUSESHIP

Respect for renunciants 2 [§37-39]

37 "But is it possible, bhante, to point out yet another fruit of recluseship, visible here and now?"

"Yes, it is, maharajah. But first, with regard to that, I will ask you a counter-question. Answer however you please.

What do you think, maharajah? Suppose you have a farmer, a householder, a taxpayer swelling the royal treasury**.** He might think:

'Isn't the results of merit amazing! For this rajah of Magadha, Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta, is a human being, and I, too, am a human being, yet the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha enjoys himself supplied and replete with the five cords of sensual happiness—like a god, as it were—while I am his farmer, a householder, a taxpayer swelling the royal treasury. I, too, then should do deeds of merit. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

So after some time he abandons all his wealth and relatives, shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness. Having thus gone forth he lives restrained in body, speech, and mind, content with the simplest food and shelter, delighting in solitude.

Then suppose one of your men were to inform you that this farmer, the householder, the taxpayer swelling the royal treasury has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, **[62]** would you, thus informed, say,

'Bring that man back to me. Make him again a farmer, a householder, my taxpayer swelling the royal treasury!'?"

38 "Not at all, bhante. Rather, I am the one who should bow down to him, rise up out of respect for him, invite him to a seat, invite him to accept gifts of robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicinal requisites for the sick. And I would provide him with righteous safety, defence, and protection."

"So what do you think, maharajah? That being the case, is there a visible fruit of recluseship, or is there not?"

"Yes, bhante. With that being the case, there certainly is a visible fruit of recluseship."

"This, maharajah, is **the second fruit of recluseship**, visible here and now, that I point out to you."

---

[69] *pañca kāma,guna,* namely, form, sound, smell, taste, touch that are taken as pleasurable (M 1:85, 173).

(A) MORAL DEVELOPMENT

39 "But is it possible, bhante, to point out yet another fruit of recluseship, more excellent and sublime, visible here and now?" [*see §34; this section ends at §98*]

"Yes, it is, maharajah. Listen and pay close attention. I will speak."

"Yes, bhante," replied the rajah of Magadha, Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta in assent.

The true purpose of recluseship[70]

The Blessed One said this:

40 Here, maharajah, there arises in the world the Tathagata [the Buddha Thus Come], an arhat, fully self-awakened one, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-gone [Sugata], knower of world, unexcelled trainer of tamable people, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.

Having realized by his own direct knowledge, this world with its gods, its Maras [evil tempters] and its Brahmas [high gods], this generation, with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers[71] and people, he makes it known to others.

He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, endowed with meaning and phrasing. He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

41 A householder or a householder's son, hearing the Dharma, **[63]** gains faith[72] in the Tathagata and reflects, thus:

'The household life is stifling a dusty path.[73] The life of renunciation is like the open air. It is not easy living in a house to practise the holy fully, in all its purity, like a polished conch-shell.

What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

Then, after some time, he abandons all his wealth and relatives, shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

42 When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code [Pāṭimokkha], possessed of proper conduct and resort.[74]

---

[70] This important section [§§40-42] shows the true motivation for renunciation and becoming monastics. The first two immediate benefits of renunciation [§§35-38] are motivated by worldly desires, and as such are not the true reasons for becoming a monastic. For the Skt version of this section, see Mvst 1:332-334.

[71] *Deva,* here in the sense of "gods by convention" (*sammati,deva*), ie kings or rulers. The other 2 types of *deva* are "gods by rebirth" (*upapatti,deva*) and "gods by purification" (*visuddhi,deva*), ie the Buddhas, pratyeka-buddhas and arhats. (Nc 307, KhpA 123). See §2 & n where the voc "your majesty" is *deva.*

[72] "Faith," ***saddhā***. There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) "rootless faith" (*amūlaka,saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith. (M 2:170); (2) "faith with a good cause" (*ākāravati,saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,8 401,23); also called *avecca-p,pasāda* (S 12.41.11/2:69). "Wise faith" is syn with (2). *Amūlaka* = "not seen, not heard, not suspected" (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Ledi Sayadaw** speaks of 2 kinds: "ordinary faith" (*pakati saddhā*) and "faith through cultivation" (*bhāvanā saddhā*) (*The Manuals of Buddhism,* 1965:339 f). "Ordinary faith" is mainly based on giving and pious acts (which can be either wholesome or unwholesome, depending on the intention). "Faith through cultivation" is founded on mindfulness practice and meditation. **Gethin** also speaks of 2 kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg ERE: Faith, & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge,* 1963: 387): "Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith is its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody…the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary" (Gethin 2001:207; my emphases).

[73] *Sambādho gharavāso rajā,patho.* There is a wordplay on *sambādha,* "crowded, stifling, narrow, full of hindrances," which also refers to the sexual organ, male (V 1:216, 2:134) or female (V 4:259; Sn 609; J 1:61, 4:260).

[74] *Go,cara,* lit "a cow's habitual path or pasture." Here it refers to 2 aspects of the renunciant''s life. In the Canon, it refers to places that are regarded as suitable for collecting almsfood (V 2:208). In this sense, *agocara* refers to places that are unsuitable for renunciant's as resort (whether for alms or otherwise) (D 1:63 = It 118; M 1:33, S 5:187; It 96; cf Dh 22). In Comys, *go,cara* refers to places suitable for meditation (Vism 127). We can also

Having taken up the rules of training, he trains himself in them, seeing danger in the slightest faults.

He comes to be accomplished in wholesome bodily and verbal deeds, his livelihood is purified, and he is possessed of moral virtue.

He guards the sense-doors, is accomplished in mindfulness and full awareness, and is content.[75]

THE SHORT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE

[The moralities §43-62[76] = Brahma,jāla Sutta, D 1.8-27/1:4-11]

Right bodily conduct *[D 1.8/1:4]*

43 And how, maharajah, is a monk accomplished in moral virtue?

(1) Here, maharajah, having abandoned the destruction of life, a monk[77] abstains from destroying life. He dwells with rod and weapon laid down, conscientious,[78] merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.

This is part of his moral virtue.[79]

(2) Having abandoned the taking of what is not given, he abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a pure mind.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(3) Having abandoned incelibacy, he lives a celibate life, living apart, refraining from the sexual act[80], the way of the village.[81]

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

Right Speech *[D 1.9]*

44 (4) Having abandoned false speech, he abstains from false speech. He[82] speaks the truth, holds to the truth as his bond, trustworthy, reliable, no deceiver of the world.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(5) Having abandoned divisive speech he abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. **[64]** What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there.

Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or consolidating those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks words of concord.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(6) Having abandoned abusive speech, he abstains from abusive speech. He speaks words that are humane, soothing, loving, touching, urbane, and delightful and pleasant to the multitude.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

---

take *go,cara* here in a psychological sense of *ārammaṇa,* ie, sense-objects. In other words, one "possessed of proper conduct and resort" can also incl the meaning "accomplished in proper conduct of body and of mind."

[75] On this section, cf **Cha-ḷ-ābhijāti S** (A 6.57): "While living thus as a renunciant', having abandoned the five hindrances, the mental impurities that weaken wisdom, his mind well established in the four focusses of mindfulness, having cultivated the seven awakening-factors according to reality, he is reborn in nirvana…" (A 6.57.7+10/-3:386+387) = SD 23.10.

[76] These three sections (comprising 13 items or groups) on moral virtue occur verbatim (in whole or with some omissions) in all of the first 13 suttas and may once have formed a separate "tract" (D:RD 1:3 n1). See Gethin 2001: 195 f. See Intro (3) above.

[77] *Bhikkhu*: in **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.8-28/1:3-13 = SD 25.2) the reading is *samaṇo Gotamo* throughout.

[78] *lajjī*, "feel shame, modest", explain in the Comy on S 1:73 as "one who has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*)." Opp *alajjī*, shameless.

[79] **Brahma,jāla S** refrains: *Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata* (D 1.8).

[80] *Brahma,cariya* is the supreme conduct or holy life, ie celibacy. DA points out that it involves refraining from other forms of erotic behaviour besides intercourse.

[81] *gāma,dhamma*, ie the way of the householder, vulgar (in the sense of being associated with the masses).

[82] PTS ed has *samaṇo Gotamo* here, which seems rather abrupt.

(7) Having abandoned idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is true, what is in accordance with the goal [or, what is beneficial].[83] He speaks on the Teaching [Dharma] and the Discipline [Vinaya]. He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, *[D 1:5]* backed by reason, measured, connected with the goal.[84]

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

General *[D 1.10]*

45 (8) He abstains from damaging seeds and plant life.[85]

Sāmaṇera,sikkhā 6-10 *[D 1:6]*

(9) He eats only once a day, refraining from the evening meal and from food at improper times.[86]
(10) He abstains from dancing, singing, music and from watching shows.
(11) He abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents and make-up.
(12) He abstains from high and luxurious beds and seats.
(13) He abstains from accepting gold and silver [money].

General

(14) He abstains from accepting uncooked grain; raw meat; women and girls; male and female slaves; goats and sheep, fowl and pigs; elephants, cattle, horses, and mares.
(15) He abstains from accepting fields and lands [property].[87]
(16) He abstains from running messages [or errands].
(17) He abstains from buying and selling.
(18) He abstains from dealing with false scales, false metals, and false measures.
(19) He abstains from bribery, deception, and fraud.
(20) He abstains from wounding, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, and violence.
This, too, is part of his moral moral virtue.

THE MEDIUM SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE

46[88] *[D 1.11]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to damaging seeds and plant life such as these: plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, and seeds **[65]**—he abstains from damaging seeds and plant life such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue. ***[D 1:6]***

47 *[D 1.12]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to consuming stored-up goods such as these: stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, and stored-up meat—he abstains from consuming stored-up goods such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

48 *[D 1.13]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to watching shows such as these: dancing, singing, music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals

---

[83] *attha,vādī.*
[84] *attha,saṁhitaṁ.*
[85] Curiously, this replaces the precept against intoxicants which is omitted.
[86] "Improper times" here means between noon and the following dawn (V 1:83).
[87] The Buddha however accepted land from rajahs like Bimbisāra and Pasenadi, and others like Anāthapiṇḍaka and Visākhā, which were received in the name of the Sangha. What is connoted here is accepting land on a personal basis.
[88] From here on, the numberings of PTS ed & Bodhi's tr (1989) agree. See §17a n.

and drums, painted scenes,[89] acrobatic and conjuring tricks,[90] elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, and troop movements—he abstains from watching shows such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

49 *[D 1.14]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to heedless and idle games such as these—eight-row chess, ten-row chess, chess in the air, hopscotch, spillikins [or jackstraws], dice, stick games, hand-pictures,[91] ball-games [marbles], blowing through toy pipes [playing whistling games with folded leaves], playing with toy ploughs, turning somersaults [acrobatics], playing with toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows, guessing letters drawn in the air or on one's back, guessing thoughts, mimicking deformities—*[D 1:7]* he abstains from heedless and idle games such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

50 *[D 1.15]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to high and luxurious furnishings such as these—over-sized couches, couches adorned with carved animals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woollen coverlets, woollen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringe, silk coverlets embroidered with gems; large woollen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with awnings, couches with red cushions for the head and feet—**[66]** he abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

51 *[D 1.16]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, enjoy scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these: rubbing powders into the body, massaging with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs, using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara [darkening one's eye-lashes], bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed white robes—he abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

52 *[D 1.17]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to low chatter,[92] such as these: talking about kings, robbers, ministers of state; armies, alarms, and battles; food and drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women *[D 1:8]* and heroes; the gossip of the street and the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and the future], the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss][93]–he abstains from talking about low topics such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

53 *[D 1.18]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to debates such as these—

'You do not understand this Dharma [Teaching] and Vinaya [Discipline]. I understand this Dharma and Vinaya. What could you understand of this Dharma and Vinaya? You are practising wrongly. I am practising rightly. I am being consistent. You are inconsistent. What should be said first you said after.

---

[89] *Sobha,nagarakaṁ*, "of the city of Sobha" (the city of the Gandharvas or heavenly musicians). RD thinks it refers to a ballet with fairy scenes. Bodhi: "art exhibitions."

[90] *Caṇḍālaṁ vaṁsaṁ dhopanaṁ*, an obscure phrase. The performers were presumable of the lowest caste. DA thinks of an iron ball (used for juggling?). Cf **Citta Sambhūta J** (J 4:390) where the phrase appears.

[91] The hand is dipped in paint or dye, then struck on the ground or a wall, so that the player creates the figure of an elephant, a horse, etc. In classical Thai literature, the artful trickstetr Sī Thanonchai (Skt, Śrī Dhanañjaya) is well known for this skill.

[92] *Tiracchāna,kathā*, lit animal talk. As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. Cf Lohicca S (D 1:228).

[93] *Iti,bhavâbhāva,kathā*, may be rendered as "being and non-being" or as "profit and loss", but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

What should be said after you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!'[94]

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

54 *[D 1.19]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, **[67]** are addicted to relaying messages and running errands for people such as these: kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmins, householders, or youths [who say],

'Go here, go there, take this there, fetch that here'—he abstains from running messages and errands for people such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

55 *[D 1.20]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, engage in deceitful pretensions [to attainments], flattery [for gain], subtle insinuation or hinting [for gain], pressuring [for offerings], and pursuing gain with gain, he abstains from such pretensions and flattery.[95]

This, too, is part of his moral virtue. *[D 1:9]*

THE GREAT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE[96]

56 *[D 1.21]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

reading marks on the limbs [eg, palmistry, sole-reading];
reading omens and signs;
interpreting celestial events [lightning, falling stars, comets];
interpreting dreams;
reading marks on the body [eg, physiognomy, phrenology];
reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;
offering fire oblations, oblations from a ladle, oblations of husks, rice powder, rice grains, ghee, and oil;
offering oblations using oral spells;
offering blood-sacrifices;
making predictions based on the fingertips;
determining whether the site for a proposed house or garden is propitious or not [geomancy];
making predictions for officers of state;
laying demons in a cemetery;
laying spirits;
reciting house-protection charms [or knowledge of charms recited by those living in an earthern house];
snake charming, treating poisoning, curing scorpion-stings and rat-bites;
interpreting animal and bird sounds and the cawing of crows;
foretelling the remaining duration of life;
reciting charms for protection against arrows;
reciting charms to understand the calls of birds and animals

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

---

[94] This is stock: **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1:8), **Sāmaññ a,phala S** (D 1:66), **Pāsādika S** (D 3:117), **Saṅgīti S** (D 3:210), **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 2:3), **Sāmagāma S** (M 2:245), **Hāliddakāni S 1** (S 3:12), **Viggāhika Kathā S** (S 5:418) and **Mahā Niddesa** (Nm 1:173). See Brahmajāla S, D 1:2 f. Cf **Alagaddûpama S** (M 22) where a similar statement is made regarding the wrong reason for learning the Dharma (M 22.10/1:133).

[95] For details, see Vism 1.61-82.

[96] For Pali listing and nn, see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.21-27) = SD 25.2.

57 *[D 1.22]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

determining lucky and unlucky gems, staffs, garments, swords, arrows, bows, and other weapons;
determining lucky and unlucky women, men, boys, girls, male slaves, female slaves;
determining lucky and unlucky elephants, horses, buffaloes, bulls, cows, goats, rams, fowl, quails, lizards [or iguana], long-eared rodents,[97] tortoises, and other animals

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

58 *[D 1.23]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such **[68]** as forecasting thus: *[D 1:10]*

the leaders [rajahs][98] will march forth [advance];
the leaders will return [retreat];
our leaders will attack, and their leaders will retreat;
their leaders will attack, and our leaders will retreat;
there will be triumph for our leaders and defeat for their leaders;
there will be triumph for their leaders and defeat for our leaders;
thus there will be triumph, thus there will be defeat

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

59 *[D 1.24]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus:

there will be a lunar eclipse;
there will be a solar eclipse;
there will be an occultation of an asterism;
the sun and moon will go their normal courses;
the sun and moon will go astray;
the asterisms will go their normal courses;
the asterisms will go astray;
there will be a meteor shower;
there will be a darkening of the sky;
there will be an earthquake;
there will be thunder coming from a clear sky;
there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, and asterisms;
such will be the result of the lunar eclipse, of the solar eclipse *and so on*

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these. *[D1:11]*

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

60 *[1.25]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such **[69]** as forecasting thus:

there will be abundant rain; there will be a drought;
there will be plenty; there will be famine;
there will be rest and security; there will be danger;
there will be disease; there will be health [freedom from disease];
or they earn their living by counting, accounting, calculation,
composing poetry, or teaching hedonistic arts and doctrines

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

---

[97] *Kaṇṇika,lakkhaṇaṁ*, from *kaṇṇa*, "ear." DA thinks it means either ear-rings or house-gables, both of which do not fit here. Walshe follows the Thai tr which, probably following an old tradition, has *tun*, "bamboo-rat" (see McFarland, *Thai-English Dictionary*, p371). Franke says "an animal that is always mentioned with the hare" and considers that it must mean an animal with long ears.

[98] *Raññaṁ* (gen pl), ie the joint leaders (rajah) of a republican state in ancient India.

61 *[D 1.26]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

calculating auspicious dates for marriages (where the bride is brought home or leaves the house), betrothals, divorces;

calculating auspicious dates for collecting debts or making investments and loans; reciting charms for becoming attractive or unattractive;

curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions [or, reviving the fetuses of abortive women];[99]

reciting spells to bind a man's tongue, to paralyze his jaws, to make him lose control over his hands, or to bring on deafness;

getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a mirror, to a young girl, or to a spirit medium;

worshipping the sun, worshipping Mahā Brahmā, bringing forth flames from the mouth, invoking the goddess of luck

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

62 *[D 1.27]* Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

promising gifts to deities in return for favors; fulfilling such promises;

demonology;

teaching house-protection spells;

inducing virility and impotence;

consecrating sites for construction;

giving ceremonial mouthwashes and ceremonial bathing;

offering sacrificial fires;

preparing emetics, purgatives, expectorants, diuretics, headache cures;

preparing ear-oil, eye-drops, oil for treatment through the nose, collyrium [eye-wash] and counter-medicines;

curing cataracts, practising surgery, practising as a children's doctor, administering medicines and treatments to cure their after-effects

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.[100] [*D 1.27 ends here*.] *[D1:12]*

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

Confidence through practising the above moralities

63 A monk, maharajah, thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger anywhere owing to his restraint through moral virtue. Just as a head-anointed noble kshatriya rajah who has defeated his enemies sees no danger anywhere from his enemies, **[70]** in the same way the monk thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger owing to his restraint through moral virtue.

Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue, he experiences within himself a joy that is blameless.

This is how a monk is accomplished in moral virtue.

(B) MENTAL DEVELOPMENT

Sense-restraint (Custody of the senses)

64 And how, maharajah, does a monk guard the sense-doors?

[101]Here, maharajah, when a monk sees a form with the eye, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**,[102] insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that eye-faculty so that the evil, wholesome states of

---

[99] *Viruddha,gabbha,karaṇaṁ.*

[100] It is the practice of medicine for gain that is here condemned. (Walshe)

[101] This whole para: *Idha mahārāja bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṁ disvā na nimitta-g,gāhī hoti nânuvyañjana-g,gāhī. Yatvâdhikaraṇaṁ enaṁ cakkhundriyaṁ asaṁvutaṁ viharantaṁ abhijjhā,domanassā pāpakā akusalā dhammā an-*

covetousness and displeasure[103] might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained. He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the eye-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the eye-faculty.

When he hears a sound with the ear,… He…has restraint of the ear-faculty.
When he smells a smell with the nose,… He…has restraint of the nose-faculty.
When he tastes a taste with the tongue,… He…has restraint of the tongue-faculty.
When he feels a touch with the body,… He…has restraint of the body-faculty.

When he cognizes a mind-object with the mind, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that mind-faculty so that covetousness and displeasure, evil unwholesome states, might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained. He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the mind-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the mind-faculty.[104]

Possessing this noble restraint over the sense-faculties, he experiences within himself a joy that is blameless.

This, maharajah, is how a monk guards the sense-doors.

Mindfulness and clear knowledge[105]

65 And how, maharajah, is a monk possessed of mindfulness and clear knowledge?

Here, maharajah, when going forward and returning, he acts with clear knowledge:

(1) while going forward or back, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
(2) while looking forward or back, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
(3) while bending or stretching, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
(4) while carrying his upper robe, outer robe and bowl, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
(5) while eating, drinking, chewing and tasting, he is clearly knowing of what he is doing;
(6) while voiding or peeing, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
(7) while walking, while standing, while sitting, while asleep, while awake,[106] while talking, or while remaining silent, he is clearly aware of what he is doing.

---

vāssaveyyuṁ, tassa saṁvarāya paṭipajjati, rakkhati cakkhundriyaṁ, cakkhundriye saṁvaraṁ āpajjati. On *Na nimitta-g,gāhī hoti nânuvyañjana-g,gāhī,* lit "he is not one who grasps at a sign, he is not one who grasps at a detail (feature)," see SD 19.14. Comys say that "**sign**"(*nimitta*) here refers to a grasping arising through one's sensual lust (*chanda,rāga,vasena*) or on account of merely one's view (*diṭṭhi,matta,vasena*); "**detail**" (*anuvyañjana*) here refers to finding delight by grasping at another's limb or body part (eyes, arms, legs, etc) (Nm 2:390; Nc 141, 141; DhsA 400, 402; cf MA 1:75, 4:195; SA 3:4, 394; Nc 1:55; DhA 1:74). On other meanings of *nimitta,* see SD 13 §3.1a.

[102] See ***Nimitta & anuvyañjana*** = SD 19.14.

[103] "Covetousness and displeasure," *abhijjhā,domanassaṁ,* which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as "hankering and fretting for the world"; alt tr "covetousness and displeasure" or "longing and loathing." MA says that longing and displeasure signify the first two hindrances—sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of mind-objects, which begins with the five hindrances. Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one's meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On ***abhijjhā,domanassa,*** there is an interesting related passage from **Pubba or Pubb'eva Sambodha S** (A 3.101): "Bhikshus, before my enlightenment, when I was still a bodhisattva, this thought occurred to me… 'Whatever physical and mental joy (*sukha,somanassa*) there is in the world, that is the gratification (*assāda*) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the disadvantages (*ādīnava*) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world'." (A 3.101/1:258, pointed out to me by Robert Eddison).

[104] **D 2**.64/1:70, **10**.2.2/1:207, **33**.1.11(10)/3:225; **M 27**.15/1:180, **33**.20/1:223, **38**.35/1:269, **51**.16/1:346, **53**.8/-1:355, **94**.18/2:162, **101**.33/2:226; **S 35.120**/4:104, **35.239**/4:176; **A 3.16/**1:113, **4.14/**2:16, **4.37/**2:39, **4.164/**2:152 (×4), **4.198**.11/2:210, **5.76**.12/3:99 f, **5.140**.11/3:163, **10.99**.6/5:206, **11.18**.23/5:351. For a study, see SD 9.14.

[105] *Sati,sampajañña = sati,* "mindfulness," *sampajañña,* "clear knowledge." In **Satipaṭṭhānas Ss**, however, this section is "clear knowledge" (*sampajañña*); "mindfulness" (*sati*) See SD 13 Intro (3.6abc).

This, maharajah, is how **[71]** a monk is possessed of mindfulness and clear knowledge.

Contentment

66 And how is a monk content?

Here, maharajah, he is content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes he sets out only with these with him.

Here, just as a bird, wherever it goes, flies with its wings as its only burden; so too is he content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes, he takes only these with him.

This, maharajah, is how a monk is content.

Abandoning the mental hindrances

67 Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue, this aggregate of noble sense-restraint, this aggregate of noble mindfulness and full awareness, and this aggregate of noble contentment, he resorts to a secluded dwelling: a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a gully [gorge], a hillside cave, a cemetery, a remote forest [jungle grove], the open air, a heap of straw.[107]

Returning from his almsround, after his meal, he sits down, crosses his legs, keeps his body erect, and establishes mindfulness before him.[108]

68 (1) Abandoning **covetousness** with regard to the world, he dwells with a mind devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness.

(2) Abandoning **ill will and anger**, he dwells with a mind devoid of ill will, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will and anger.

(3) Abandoning **sloth and torpor**, he dwells with a mind devoid of sloth and torpor, mindful, alert, perceiving light. He cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor.

(4) Abandoning **restlessness and worry**, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness and worry.

(5) Abandoning **spiritual doubt**, he dwells having crossed over doubt, with no perplexity with regard to wholesome mental states. He cleanses his mind of doubt.

Similes for the hindrances

69 (1) Suppose that a man, maharajah, taking a loan, invests it in his businesses. His businesses succeed. He repays his old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my businesses. **[72]** Now my businesses have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining my wife.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

---

[106] "When asleep, when awake" *sutte jāgarite.* Comy glosses *sutte* as *sayane,* "lying down, sleeping." See Intro (3.6c).

[107] *So iminā ca ariyena sīla-k,khandhena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena indriya,saṁvarena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena sati,sampajaññena samannāgato imāya ca ariyāya santuṭṭhitāya samannāgato vivittaṁ senâsanaṁ bhajati, araññaṁ rukkha,mūlaṁ pabbataṁ kandaraṁ giri,guhaṁ susānaṁ vana,patthaṁ abbhokāsaṁ palāla,puñjaṁ.* This stock phrase of 9 places conducive to meditation are found at D 1:72. 207, 2:242, 3:49; M 1:181, 269, 274, 346, 440, 441, 2:162, 226, 3:3, 35, 115-117; A 2:210, 3:92, 100, 4:436, 5:207; Nm 1:26, 140, 2:341; Miln 369. A shorter list, probably later, is mentioned in **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118): "Here, monks, a monk who has gone to the forest or to the foot of a tree or to an empty house, sits down, and having crossed his legs and keeping his body upright, establishes mindfulness before him." (M 118.17/3:82).

[108] Comy. He applies mindfulness towards his meditation subject; or he sets it up in the region of the mouth. As such, it is said in the Vibhaṅga: "This mindfulness is set up, set up well, at the tip of the nose or at the sign of the mouth" (Vbh ¶537/252). NṬ: The "sign of the mouth" (*mukha,nimitta*) is the middle region of the upper lip, against which the air strikes when it comes out of the nose.

70 (2) Now, maharajah, suppose that a man falls sick, in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was sick. Now, I have recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

71 (3) Now, maharajah, suppose that a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was bound in prison. Now, I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

72 (4) Now, maharajah, suppose that a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, free, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was a slave... Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.' **[73]** Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

73 (5) Now, maharajah, suppose that a man, carrying money and goods, is journeying on a road through the wilderness. As time passes, he eventually emerges from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, carrying money and goods, I was journeying on a road through the wilderness. Now I have emerged from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

74 In the same way, maharajah, when these five hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a journey on a road through the wilderness.[109]

Resultant joy and peace

75 When he is aware that these five hindrances are abandoned in him, he regards it as solvency, good health, release from prison, emancipation, a place of security.

76[110] Seeing that they have been abandoned within him, he becomes glad. For one who is glad, zest arises. For one whose mind zestful, the body becomes tranquil. One tranquil in body becomes happy. For one who is happy, the mind concentrates.[111]

THE FOUR DHYANAS

The 1st dhyana

77 (1) Quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he attains and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompani-

---

[109] MA 2:318-321 explains this section in some detail: see Appendix to **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39) tr in Sutta Discovery, 2004.

[110] From here on, the numbering breaks off from the PTS ed and follows Bodhi's (1989:40). See §46 n.

[111] *Tass'ime pañca nīvaraṇe pahīṇe attani samanupassato pāmojjaṁ jāyati. Pamuditassa pīti jāyati. Pītimanassa kāyo passambhati. Passaddha,kāyo sukhaṁ vedeti. Sukhino cittaṁ samādhiyati.* This important stock passage is found throughout the Nikāyas: **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.76/1:73), **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.10a/1:182), **Subha S** (D 10.2.-21/1:207), **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11.44/1:214), **Tevijja S** (D 13/1:250), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33/3:241, 243), **Das'uttara S** (D 34/3:279 (×5); **Vatthûpama S** (M 7/1:38 (×3), **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40.8/1:283); **Ānâpāna,sati S** (M 118/3:86 (×2), 87 (×2)); **Pamāda,vihārī S** (S 35.97/4:78 (×2), 79 (×2)); **Pāṭaliya S** (S 42.13/4:352 (×2), 353-358); **Sīla S** (S 46.3/5:69 (×2)), **Upakkilesa S** (S 46.33/5:92), **Anupakkilesa S** (S 46.34/5:93 (×2)), **Bhikkhuṇī Vāsaka S** (S 5:156 (×2)), **Ānanda S** (S 54.13/5:332 (×2), *sambojjhaṅga*), **Bhikkhū S** (S 54.16/5:339 (×2), *sambojjhaṅga*), **Nandiya S** (S 55.40/5:398 (×3), 399); **Parisa S** (A 3.93/1:243), **Ājāniya S** (A 3.94/1:244), **Jāta,rūpa S** (A 3.100 /1:254, 257, 258); **Vimuttâyatana S** (A 5.26/3:21, 22 (×2), 23 (×2); **(Agata,phala) Mahānāma S** (A 6.10/3:285 (×2), 286, 287 (×2), 288); **(Dasaka) Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 10.2/5:3); **(Eka,dasaka) Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 11.2/5:312), **Paṭhama Mahānāma S** (A 11.12/5:329, 330 (×2), 331 (×2), 332), **Dutiya Mahānāma S** (A 11.13/5:334).

ed by zest and happiness, born of solitude.[112] He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body[113] with the zest and happiness born of solitude.[114] **[74]**

78 Maharajah, just as if a skilled bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath powder—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would not drip; even so, the monk permeates—this very body with the zest and happiness born of solitude. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of solitude.

This, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.[115]

The 2nd dhyana

79 (2) And, furthermore, maharajah, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.[116] He permeates and pervades, **[75]** suffuses and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration.

80 Maharajah, just as a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having no inflow from the east, west, north, or south, and with the skies supplying abundant showers time and again, so that the cool spring welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, suffuse and fill it with cool waters, there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters; even so, the monk permeates this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of concentration.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

The 3rd dhyana

81 (3) And furthermore, maharajah, with the fading away of zest, he remains equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body. He attains and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, 'Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.' He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

82 Maharajah, just as in a pond of the blue lotuses, red and white lotuses, or red lotuses,[117] born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated, pervaded, suffused and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water; even so, the monk permeates this very body with the happiness free from zest, so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with this happiness free from zest.

---

[112] On the omission of "one-pointedness of mind" (*cittassa ek'aggatā*) and "concentration" (*samādhi*) here, see **The layman and dhyana** = SD 8.5.

[113] Here "body" (*kāya*) refers to the "mental body" (*nāma,kāya*), ie feeling (*vedanā*), perception (*saññā*), formations (*saṅkhāra*), and consciousness (*viññāṇa*) (Vism 4.175/169).

[114] These are the dhyana factors: *vitakka vicāra pīti sukhassa ek'aggatā,* respectively.

[115] This concludes the Buddha's answer to the first part of the question asked in §40.

[116] The 2nd dhyana is known as "the noble silence" (*ariya,tuṇhī,bhāva*) because within it applied thought and sustained thought (thinking and discursion, *vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf. S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to "either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence" (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

[117] *uppala* (Skt *utpala*), *paduma* (*padma*) and *puṇḍarīka* respectively. This simile also found in **Kāya,gatā,sati S** (M 119.20/3:93 f). See **Āyācana S** (S 6.12/1:138) where the simile of lotuses in a pond is applied to beings of different spiritual dispositions.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

The 4th dhyana

83 (4) And furthermore, maharajah, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain—and with the earlier disappearance of happiness and displeasure—he attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana**, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity. He sits, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind,[118] so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind.

84 Maharajah, just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth, **[76]** so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend; even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright mind. There is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by pure, bright mind.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

Insight knowledge

85 [119]With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,[120] pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to **knowledge and vision**. He knows:

'This body of mine is form composed of the four great elements,[121] born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion.[122] And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.'[123]

86 [124]Maharajah, just as if there were a beautiful beryl[125] gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white thread, or brown thread[126]—and a man with good eyesight, taking it in his hand, were to reflect on it thus:

---

[118] See **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1-2): "Monks, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The uninstructed ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development." (A 1:10). On reaching the 4th dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the truly and naturally pure nature of the mind. See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

[119] This and foll passage = **Subha S** (D 10.2.21-22/1:209).

[120] *upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

[121] The 4 great (or primary): earth (*mahā,bhūtā*), water, fire, wind (D 1:214; Vism 11.27; Abhs 154).

[122] See **Vammika S** (M 23.4/1:144) for parable of the anthill (representing the body).

[123] This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body. RD points out that this and other passages disprove the idea that the consciousness (*viññāṇa*) transmigrates. For holding such a view, Sāti was severely rebuked by the Buddha (M 38). A new re-linking consciousness (*paṭisandhi*) arises at conception, dependent on the old one (see Vism 17.164 ff).

[124] This and prev passage = **Subha S** (D 10.2.21-22/1:209) = **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 77.29/2:17). The beryl simile, relating to the Bodhisattva's gestation period (as a foetus), at **Mahâpadāna S** (D 14.1.21/2:13) = **Acchariya Abbhūta S** (M 123.12/3:121). *Paṇḍu.sutta* is found in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where EB Cowell & WHD Rouse tr it as "white thread" (J:C&R 6:147).

[125] *Veluriya*: from a metathesis of *veruliya* comes Greek *beryllos* "beryl", whence German *Brille* "spectacles" (originally of beryl). (Walshe)

[126] "Through which runs…etc," *tatra suttaṁ āvutaṁ nīlaṁ vā pītaṁ vā lohitaṁ vā odātaṁ vā paṇḍu,suttaṁ vā.* Rhys Davids tr ***pīta*** here as "orange-coloured," and ***paṇḍu*** as "yellow" (D:RD 1:87), while Bodhi has as "yellow" and "brown" respectively (1989:44). *Paṇḍu,sutta* is found in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where EB Cowell & WHD Rouse tr it as "white thread" (J:C&R 6:147). Both ***pīta*** and ***paṇḍu*** sometimes refer to "yellow." SED def *pāṇḍu* as "yellowish white, white, pale." Comys offer no explanation, except that the gem "is like the physical body, and the thread running through it is like insight knowledge (*vipassanā,ñāṇa*)" (DA 1:211). DANṬ (New Subcomy) corrects "insight knowledge" to "insight consciousness" (*vipassanā,viññāṇa,* DANṬ :VRI 2:126). **Jothiko**:

'This is a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white, or brown thread.'

Even so, maharajah—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and utterly unshakable—he directs and inclines it to knowledge and vision. He knows:

'This body of mine is form, composed of the four great elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to uncertainty, rubbing, pressing, breaking up and destruction. **[77]** And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.'[127]

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

Knowledge of the mind-made body

87 With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to creating **a mind-made body**.[128] From this body he creates another body, endowed with form,[129] mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties.

88 Maharajah, just as if a man were to draw a reed from its sheath, the thought would occur to him:

'This is the sheath, this is the reed. The sheath is one thing, the reed another, but the reed has been drawn out from the sheath.'

Or, maharajah, as if a man were to draw a sword from its scabbard. The thought would occur to him:

'This is the sword, this is the scabbard. The sword is one thing, the scabbard another, but the sword has been drawn out from the scabbard.'

Or, maharajah, as if a man were to pull a snake out from its slough. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the snake, this is the slough. The snake is one thing, the slough another, but the snake has been pulled out from the slough';

Even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated*, from this body he creates another body, endowed with form, mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

"Generally, 'knowledge and vision' is the ability, the state of clarity, enabling one to see even hidden things clearly. So the image of a transparent gem. It is both 'higher than Jhāna', if the absorptions are taken as 'pleasant abiding in the here and now.' And 'less than the absorptions' if they are used as a way of reaching full enlightenment. So, obviously, it is not the *sammā ñāṇa*—knowledge of liberation. The colors at old were often associated with natural phenomena. ***Paṇḍu*** is earthen colors, the word used even today to denote the dyeing of robes: various natural hues of brown, mostly. Just as ***lohita*** is both 'blood' and the color of 'red,' *pitta* [***pīta***] is 'bile' and its shades, mostly 'light green,' off yellow." (email 13 Nov 2006). It is possible that the six colours represent the six sense-consciousnesses. The first 4 colours are those of the colour *kasiṇa* meditations: see **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.29-32/2:110 f) = SD 9. See ***Viññāṇa*** = SD 17.8a (4.1).

[127] This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body.

[128] "Mind-made body," *mano,mayā kāya.* Peter Harvey: "This shows that consciousness is seen as able to leave the physical body by means of a mind-made body. Such a body could be seen as a kind of 'subtle body,' for a being with a mind-made body is said to feed on joy (D 1:17), not on solid nutriment (D 1:195): it thus lacks the four great elements of the physical body (solidity, cohesion, heat and motion, D 1:195). As such a body relates to the 'realm of (pure) form,' the subtle matter composing it can only be visible and audible matter (Vbh 405). However, the mind-made body is invisible to the normal eye (Pm 2:209). It occupies space, but does not impinge on gross physical matter, for the 'selfhood' of a certain god with a mind-made body is said to be as large as two or three fields, but to cause no harm to anyone (A 3:122). With such a body, a person can exercise psychic powers such as going through solid objects, being in many places at once, or flying (D 1:78)." (1993:8 digital ed)

[129] Exactly the same as the physical body (but mentally created). This mind-made body is what is mistaken for a soul or self.

KNOWLEDGE OF THE MODES OF SUPERNORMAL POWER

Mundane superknowledge [§89-98]

(1) PSYCHIC POWERS:

89 With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,[130] pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to [78] the manifold psychic power.[131]

(1) Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one.
(2) He appears, and vanishes.
(3) He goes unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.
(4) He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water.
(5) He walks on water without sinking as if it were earth.
(6) Sitting cross-legged, he flies through the air like a winged bird.
(7) With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and the moon.
(8) He has power over his body up to as far as the Brahmā worlds: so mighty and powerful is he.

90 Maharajah, just as a skilled potter or his assistant could craft from well-prepared clay whatever kind of pottery vessel he likes, or, maharajah, as a skilled ivory-carver or his assistant could craft from well-prepared ivory any kind of ivory-work he likes, or, maharajah, as a skilled goldsmith or his assistant could craft from well-prepared gold any kind of gold article he likes—even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated,* he has power over his body up to as far as the Brahmā worlds. **[79]**

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

(2) CLAIRAUDIENCE (DIVINE EAR):

91 With his mind thus *concentrated,* he hears, by means of the divine-ear element,[132] purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

92 Maharajah, just as if a man travelling along a highway were to hear the sounds of bheri [conical drum], mridanga [tom-tom],[133] conch-shell, cymbals, and dindima [small drum], he would know,

'That is bheri sound; that is mridanga sound; that is conch sound; that is cymbal sound; that is dindima sound'—even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated,* he hears, by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

(3) MIND-READING:

93 With his mind thus *concentrated,* he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of mind-reading. He knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.[134]

He knows a mind with lust as a mind with lust,
and a mind without lust as a mind without lust. **[80]**
He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with aversion,
and a mind without aversion as a mind without aversion.
He knows a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion,
and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion.

---

[130] *upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

[131] *Iddhi,vidhā.* Cf **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11) where the Buddha disapproves of exhibiting such powers (D 11.4-5/-1:213 f) = SD 1.7.

[132] "Divine-ear element," *dibba,sota,dhātu,* clairaudience.

[133] "Mridanga," *mutiṅgā,* vl *mudiṅgā* (V 1:15, S 2:267). See **Āṇi S** (S 20.7.2) tr n in Sutta Discovery, 2004.

[134] The following section (italicized) is a list of mental states is apparently taken from **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22.12/2:299 = M 10.34/1:59), where it fits more appropriately. (Walshe, D:W 546 n131). On another def of mind-reading (4 kinds), see **Sampasādaniya S** (D 28.6/3:103 f) = SD 14.10.

He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as a contracted mind,
and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and worry] as a distracted mind.
He knows an exalted mind [through the lower or higher dhyana] as an exalted mind,
and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as an unexalted mind.
He knows a surpassable mind as a surpassable mind,
and an unsurpassable mind as an unsurpassable mind[135].
He knows a concentrated mind as a concentrated mind,
and an unconcentrated mind as an unconcentrated mind.
He knows a released mind as a released mind,
and an unreleased mind as an unreleased mind.

94 Maharajah, just as if **a young man or woman, fond of ornaments**, examining the reflection of his or her own face in a bright mirror or a bowl of clear water would know 'blemished' if it were blemished, or 'unblemished' if it were not—even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated,* he knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind. He knows a mind with lust… without lust;…with aversion…without aversion; …with delusion…without delusion; a contracted mind, a distracted mind; an exalted mind, an unexalted mind; a surpassable mind, an unsurpassable mind; a concentrateed mind, an unconcentrated mind; a released mind, an unreleased mind—*he knows each of them just as it is*. **[81]**

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

(4) THE KNOWLEDGE OF THE RECOLLECTION OF PAST LIVES:[136]

95 With his mind thus *concentrated,* he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the recollection of past lives.[137] He recollects manifold past existence, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'

Thus, maharajah, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.[138]

96 PARABLE OF THE TRAVELLER. Just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him,

'I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I went to that village over there, and there I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I came back home';[139] **[82]**

Even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated,* he recollects his manifold past lives...in their modes and details.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

---

[135] Unsurpassable (*anuttaraṁ*) mind, probably synonymous with "developed" mind. See D:W 592 n667.

[136] This knowledge and the foll three (ie 4-6) constitutes "the three knowledges" (*te,vijja*) of the Buddha and the arhats (D 3:220, 275; A 5:211), and is a shorthand for "the 6 knowledges" (*cha-ḷ-ābhiññā*) listed here and elsewhere.

[137] *Pubbe,nivāsanânussati,ñāṇa*, lit "the knowledge of the recollection of past abidings [existences]." The reainder of this is expanded into 4 sections in **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.1.31-34/1:13-16 = SD 25.3(76.3)) and 3 sections in **Sampasādaniya S** (D 27.15-17/3:107-112 = SD 10.12). In both cases, each explains how the eternalist view arose.

[138] This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

[139] The 3 villages are the world of sense-desire, the form world, and the formless world (DA).

(5) THE KNOWLEDGE OF DEATH AND BIRTH (THE DIVINE EYE):

97 With his mind thus *concentrated,* he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings.[140] He sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance],[141] purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:

'These beings—who were endowed with evil conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death, with the body's breaking up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, with the body's breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.'

Thus, maharajah, by means of the divine eye, **[83]** he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and *how they fare according to* their karma.

98 PARABLE OF THE CITY SQUARE.[142] Maharajah, just as if there were a mansion in the central square [where four roads meet]**,** and a man with good eyesight standing on top of it were to see people entering a house, leaving it, wandering along the carriage-road, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet]. The thought would occur to him,

'These people are entering a house, leaving it, walking along the streets, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet].'[143]

Even so, maharajah, with his mind thus *concentrated,* he sees by means of the divine eye, how beings *fare in accordance* with their karma.

This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

(C) DEVELOPMENT OF WISDOM

(6) THE KNOWLEDGE OF THE DESTRUCTION OF MENTAL CANKERS.

99a With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the destruction of the mental cankers.[144]

99b He knows, as it is really is, 'This is suffering';
he knows as it really is, 'This is the arising of suffering';
he knows as it really is, 'This is the ending of suffering';

---

[140] *Cutûpapāta ñāṇa,* "the knowledge of the falling away and rebirth (of beings)," or "knowledge of rebirth according to karma" (*yathā,kammûpaga ñāṇa*), or "the divine eye" (*dibba,cakkhu*): see foll n.

[141] *Dibba,cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma,cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1) = SD 25.3(76.3). See prec n.

[142] On this parable, see also SD 2.17(8).

[143] On the significance of this simile in confirming canonical acceptance of the intermediate state (*antarā,-bhava*), see "**Is Rebirth Immediate?**" = SD 2.17.8.

[144] ***Āsava-k,khaya,ñāṇa***. The term *āsava* (lit "cankers") comes from *ā-savati* "flows towards" (ie either "into" or "out" towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints ("deadly taints", RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists four *āsava*: the canker of (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence or becoming (*bhav'āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjâsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as "floods" (*oghā*) and "yokes" (*yogā*). The list of three cankers (omitting the canker of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under āsava.

he knows as it really is, 'This is the path to the ending of suffering';[145]

he knows as it really is, 'These are mental cankers';
he knows as it really is, 'This is the arising of cankers';
he knows as it really is, 'This is the ending of cankers';
he knows as it really is, 'This is the path to the ending of cankers.'[146]

99c His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the canker of sensual desire, the canker of existence, the canker of ignorance.[147] With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released (am I)!' He knows that 'Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this.'[148]

100 Maharajah, just as if there were **a pool of water in a mountain glen**, clear, limpid, unsullied,[149] where, a person with good eyes, from its edge, would see shellfish and shells, or gravel and pebbles, or shoals of fish moving about or resting in it,[150] and it would occur to him,

'This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting'—even so, with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and utterly unshakable, the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of the mental cankers, *and in due course is liberated*.

[85] This, too, maharajah, is a fruit of recluseship, visible here and now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime. And as for another visible fruit of recluseship, higher and more sublime than this, there is none."[151] [*see §39*]

Ajātasattu's refuge-taking

101a When this was said, the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha said this to the Blessed One:

"Excellent, bhante! Excellent, bhante! Just as if, bhante, one were to place upright what had been overturned, were to reveal what was hidden, were to show the way to one who was lost, or were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way, in numerous ways, the Dharma has been made clear by the Blessed One.

Bhante, I go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dharma, and to the community of monks. May the Blessed One remember me as a layman who has gone for refuge, from this day forth, for life.

Ajātasattu's confession

101b Bhante, I have committed an offence[152] when I behaved in such a foolish manner, in such a confused manner, in such an unwholesome manner, as to kill my father—a righteous man, a righteous rajah—for the sake of sovereign rulership.

---

[145] These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called "noble truths" here (nor in **Ariya,pariyesanā S**, M 26.43). Norman remarks that these four statements, which also likewise appear in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M36.42/1:249), but are not referred to as the noble truths about suffering, "and since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the *āsavas,* it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition [here], which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the *āsavas,* to provide a symmetry" (Norman 1990:26). For a discussion on the formulation of the noble truths, see Norman 1982:377-91 & also Schmithausen 1981:205.

[146] As in **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 26.42) = SD 1. On the application of the four noble truth template to both *dukkha* and to *āsava* here, see Analayo 2003:224 n28 & SD 17.4(8.4)

[147] See §97a n.

[148] *Nâparaṁ itthatāya*: lit. "there is no more of 'thusness.'" See **Mahānidāna S** (M 15.22) = SD 5.17.

[149] "Clear, limpid, unsullied," *accho vipassanno anāvilo.*

[150] *Udaka,rahado accho vippasanno anāvilo tattha cakkhumā puriso tīre ṭhito passeyya sippi,sambukam pi sakkhara,kaṭhalam pi maccha,gumbam pi carantam pi tiṭṭhantam pi.* This whole section also in **Paṇihita Acchanna Vagga** (A 1.5.5-6) in the same context, differently worded.

[151] All the preceding "fruits" lead up to this, which alone, as RD points out is exclusively Buddhist. See n42.

Bhante, may the Blessed One please forgive my transgression as such, so that I may restrain myself in the future."[153]

102 "Yes, maharajah, you have transgressed in that you were so foolish, so ignorant, so inept as to kill your father—a righteous man, a righteous rajah—for the sake of sovereign rulership.

But, maharajah, because you see your transgression as such and make amends in accordance with the Dharma, we accept[154] your majesty.

For, maharajah, it is a cause of growth in the Dharma and Vinaya [Teaching and Discipline] of the noble ones when, seeing an offence as such, one makes amends in accordance with the Dharma and shows restraint in the future."

103 When this was said, the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha said to the Blessed One:

"Well, then, bhante, we now depart. Many are our duties, much there is to be done."

"Please, maharajah, do as you deem fit here."[155]

The rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha, joyfully approving of the Blessed One's words, rose from his seat, bowed down to him, and, keeping the Buddha to his right, departed.

104 Then not long after **[86]** the rajah Ajātasattu Vedehi,putta of Magadha had left, the Blessed One addressed the monks:

"The rajah is uprooted, monks; the rajah is tormented![156] Had he not killed his father—that righteous man, that righteous rajah—the dustless, stainless Dharma eye[157] would have arisen to him even as he sat in this very seat."

This is what the Blessed One said. The monk joyfully approved of[158] the Blessed One's words.

---

[152] *accaya.*

[153] *Accayo maṁ bhante accagamā yathā,bālaṁ yathā,mūḷhaṁ yathā,akusalaṁ sāham evaṁ akāsiṁ. Tassa me bhante bhagavā accayaṁ accayato paṭiggaṇhātu āyatiṁ saṁvarāyâ ti.* Both this confession and the foll para (the Buddha's response) are stock monastic formula used when confessing transgressions (V 1:314, 4:18 f). For more refs, see CPD: *accaya.* See **(Taṇhā) Bhikkhuṇī S** (A 4.159.8/2:146); **Vuṭṭha S** (A 9.11.6/4:378). Cf the wanderer's Nigrodha's confession in **Udumbarika Sīhanāda S** (D 25.22a = SD 1.4) & Susīma's confession in **Susīma S** (S 12.70 = SD 16.6).

[154] "We accept," *paṭigaṇhāma,* sometimes, but improperly, "we forgive"; here the 1st pl is not the royal pronoun, but the Buddha, on behalf of the Sangha, "forgives" the transgression.

[155] *Yassa dāni tvaṁ mahārāja kālaṁ maññasî ti,* lit "Please do what you think it is now the time to do." This is stock: **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.103/1:85 = SD 8.10); **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.6/2:104 = SD 13), **Sekha S** (M 53.3/1:354 = SD 21.14), **Kaṇṇaka-t,thala S** (M 90.17/2:132 f = SD 10.8); **Puṇṇ'ovāda S** (M 145.6/3:269 = S 35.88/4:62,31 = SD 20.15), **Avassuta S** (S 35.243/4:183,15, 30), **Khemā Therī S** (S 44.1/4:379,29), **Vesālī S** (S 54.9/5:321,16, 17) & **Thapatayā S** (S 55.6/5:348,27). See Joy Manné, "On a departure formula and its translation," *Buddhist Studies Review* 10, 1993:27-43.

[156] *Khatâyaṁ bhikkhave rājā, upahatâyaṁ bhikkhave rājā.* RD errs here: "This king, brethren was deeply affected, he was touched in heart." Lit. "injured and devastated" or "uprooted and destroyed", the expression indicates that Ajātasattu was inhibited by his karma from obtaining the results that would otherwise have accrued, since parricide (intentional killing of one's parent) is one of the evil acts "with immediate result" (in the next world) that cannot be avoided. DA remarks that he was unable to sleep until his visit to the Buddha. The passive present verb *khata* comes from *khaṇati,* which has two forms in Skt: (1) *kṣaṇoti,* "hurts, injures, impairs" (V 2:26 = M 1:132; A 3:350), as *khata* it is common (V 5:161; **D 1:86**; S 1:27; A 1:89); (2) *khanati,* "digs, digs up, excavates" (V 3:48, 4:32; M 2:51; S 1:127: A 5:159; Dh 247; U 15; Tha 402), but *khata* is Commentarial (VA 755). However, both senses can apply here, although historically the first sense is meant. The present participle *upahata* (V 5:168: **D 1:86**; Dh 134) comes from *uphanati,* "hits, comes into contact with, reaches; hurts, damages, impairs" (S 4:56, 5:325; Tha 325). *Upahanati* is formed by the preverb *upa* (means "close up to, almost") + *hanati* (to strike; to kill). See DP svv.

[157] "The opening of the Dharma-eye (***dhamma,cakkhu***)" refers to one's "entering the stream," thus irrevocably walking the path. Spiritually, as such, it is superior to the divine eye (*dibba,cakkhu*) (§95), which is merely an advanced form of clairvoyance but inferior the wisdom eye (*paññā,cakkhu*) or the wisdom of the arhat. The Cūḷa Niddesa mentions **5 kinds of eyes**: (1) the physical eye (*maṁsa,cakkhu*); (2) the divine eye (*dibba,cakkhu*); (3) the wisdom eye (*paññā,cakkhu*) of the arhats; (4) the Buddha eye (*Buddha-cakkhu*); and (5) the universal eye (*samanta,cakkhu*), the omniscience of the Buddhas (Nc 235; nos 1-2 at It 52). See n in §95: divine eye.

—evaṁ—

[158] *Attamanā…abhinanduṁ.* The monks mentally rejoiced.

Bibliography

Basham, AL

1951 *History and Doctrines of the Ājīvikas.* London: Luzac, 1951.

1989 *The Origins and Development of Classical Hinduism.* [Orig lecture nn] Ed & annot Kenneth G Zysk. Boston: Beacon Press, 1989.

Bodhi, Bhikkhu

1989 (tr) *The Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship: The Sāmaññaphala Sutta and its Commentaries.* Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1989.

Bronkhorst, Johannes

1993 *Two Traditions of Meditation in Ancient India.* [Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden, 1986. xii 145pp 24 cm] 2nd ed Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1993. xviii 153pp hb incl pagination of 1st ed.

Burma Tipiṭaka Association

1990 (tr) "Sāmaññaphala Sutta (The Fruits of the Life as a Samaṇa)." In *Ten Suttas From the Dīgha Nikāya,* Yangoon: Burma Tipiṭaka Association, 1990.

Derrett, JDM

1983 (tr) *A Textbook for Novices*. A translation of Jayarakṣita's "Perspicacious Commentary on the Compendium of Conduct by Śrīghana." Turin: Indologica Taurinensia. 1983.

Gethin, Rupert

2001 *The Path to Awakening.* [E J Brill 1992] Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2nd ed 2001. [A study of the 37 *bodhi,pakkhiya,dhammā.*]

Gombrich, Richard

1975 "Buddhist karma and social control." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 17,2 Apr 1975:212-220.

1984 "Notes on the brahminical background to Buddhist ethics." In *Buddhist Studies in Honour of Hammalava Saddhātissa,* ed G Dhammapala, R Gombrich & KR Norman. Nugegoda: University of Sri Jayewardenepura, 1984:91-102.

Harvey, [Brian] Peter, 1951-

1993 "The mind body relationship in Pali Buddhism: A philosophical investigation." *Asian Philosophy* 3,1 1993:29-41. http://pears2.lib.ohio-state.edu/FULLTEXT/cf_eng.htm.

Jaini, Padmanabh S

2001 (ed) *Collected Papers on Buddhist Studies.* [1970.] Foreword by Paul Dundas. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 2001.

Jayatilleke, K N

1963 *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge.* London: Allen & Unwin 1963; repr Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980. [Śramaṇa movement, 1963:69-168.] Bk rev →Robinson, Richard H.P., 1969. Cf A.B. Keith, 1963.

Keown, Damien

1983 "Morality in the *Visuddhimagga.*" [1980] *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 6,1 1983.

1993 *The Nature of Buddhist Ethics.* Basingstoke & London: Macmillan, 1993.

MacQueen, Graeme

1984 "The doctrines of the six heretics according to the Śrāmaṇyaphala Sūtra." *Indo-Iranian Journal* 27,4 Oct 1984:291-307.

1988 "A Study of the Śrāmaṇyaphala-Sūtra." [Harvard University dissertation 1978]. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1988.

Meisig, Konrad

1987 *Das Śrāmaṇyaphala-sūtra: Synoptische Übersetzungen und Glossar der chinesischen Fassungen verglichen mit dem Sanskrit und Pāli.* Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1987.

Norman, KR

1982 "The four noble truths: a problem of Pāli syntax." In *Indological and Buddhist Studies: Festschrift for JW de Jong.* Canberra, 1982:377-391.

1983b "Pali Literature: Including the Canonical Literature in Prakrit and Sanskrit of all Hīnayāna Schools of Buddhism." In J Gonda (ed), *A History of Indian Literature,* vol 7, fasc 2, Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1983.

1990 "Aspects of Early Buddhism." In David Seyfort Ruegg & Lambert Schmithausen (eds), *Earliest Buddhism and Madhyamaka,* Leiden: EJ Brill, 1990:24-35. Repr in KR Norman, *Collected Papers* vol 4, Oxford: Pali Text Society, 1993:124-138.

Rhys Davids, Thomas W

1899 (tr) "Sâmaññ-phala Suttanta" in *Dialogues of the Buddha,* vol. 1. London: Pali Text Society, 1899.

Schmithausen, Lambert

1981 "Liberating insight and meditation in early Buddhism." In *Studien zum Jainismus und Buddhismus (Gedenkschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf),* Hamburg, 1981.

Ṭhānissaro Bhikkhu

2000 Rev tr "Sāmaññaphala Sutta: The Fruits of the Contemplative Life." www.accesstoinsight.org/canon/digha/dn2.html

Walshe, Maurice

1996 (tr) *The Long Discourses of the Buddha.* Boston: Wisdom, 1995.

Yamaguchi, Susumu

1960 (ed) *Buddhism and Culture.* Kyoto: Nakano Press, 1960.

041108; rev 061115; 071023; 080502