2
Brahma,jāla Sutta
The Discourse on the Perfect Net

[The 62 grounds for wrong views]
(Dīgha Nikāya 1/1:1-46)
Translated by Piya Tan ©2003

I. THE TALK ON WANDERERS
(*paribbājaka kathā*)

1 <1.1>[1] Thus have I heard.

Suppiya and Brahma,datta

At one time the Blessed One was travelling on the highway between Rājagaha and Nālandā together with a great community of monks, numbering about five hundred.

At that time, the wanderer Suppiya, too, was travelling along the highway between Rājagaha and Nālandā together with his pupil, the youth Brahma,datta. Right there, the wanderer Suppiya spoke in many ways against the Buddha, against the Dharma, and against the Sangha, but the wanderer Suppiya's pupil, the youth Brahma,datta, on the other hand, spoke in various ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dharma, and in praise of the Sangha.

Thus, the two, teacher and pupil, following closely step for step behind the Blessed One and the community of monks, speaking in a manner directly contradicting one another.[2]

2 <1.2> Then the Blessed One and the community of monks entered the royal resthouse in the Amba,laṭṭhika grove, dwelling there for a night.

The wanderer Suppiya, too, with his pupil, the young Brahma,datta, entered the royal resthouse in the Amba,laṭṭhika grove, dwelling there for a night.

Even there, too, the wanderer Suppiya spoke in various ways against the Buddha, against the Dharma, and against the Sangha, but the wanderer Suppiya's **[2]** pupil, the youth Brahma,datta, on the other hand, spoke in various ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dharma, and in praise of the Sangha.

Thus, the two, teacher and pupil, dwelled together, speaking in a manner directly contradicting one another.[3]

The monks discuss the incident

3 <1.3> Then, when the night has passed [at dawn], a number of monks, after rising, assembled in the pavilion. Having assembled there, this trend of talk[4] arose:

"It is wonderful, avuso! It is marvelous! How the Blessed One, who knows, who sees, has so fully penetrated the various dispositions of beings.

For this wanderer Suppiya spoke in various ways against the Buddha, against the Dharma, and against the Sangha, but the wanderer's pupil, the youth Brahma,datta, on the other hand, spoke in various ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dharma, and in praise of the Sangha.

---

[1] The former number refers to the running sequence of paragraphs; the latter within <angle brackets> refers to the *Bhāṇavāra.*verse (foll PTS ed).

[2] *Iti ha te ubho ācariy'antevāsī āñña-m-aññassa uju,vipaccanīka,vādā bhagavantaṁ piṭṭhito piṭṭhito anubaddhā honti bhukkhu,saṅghañ ca.*

[3] *Iti ha te ubho ācariy'antevāsī āñña-m-aññassa uju,vipaccanīka,vādā viharanti.* PTS simply repeats as in §1 (see prec n), which is probably an editorial oversight.

[4] *Saṅkhiya,dhamma,*or "turn of conversation."

Thus, the two, teacher and pupil, following close behind the Blessed One and the community of monks, speaking in a manner directly contradicting one another."

4 <1.4> Then the Blessed One, having known the trend of talk, went to the pavilion. Having reached the pavilion, he sat down on the prepared seat. Seated thus on the prepared seat, the Blessed One addressed the monks, thus:

"Bhikshus, what talk are you having just now, sitting here, and what is the topic of conversation?"

When this was spoken, the monks said this to the Blessed One:

"Bhante, when the night has passed [at dawn], we, after rising, assembled here in the pavilion. Having assembled here, this trend of talk arose:

'*It is wonderful, avuso! It is marvellous! How the Blessed One, who knows, who sees, has so fully penetrated the various dispositions of beings.*

For this wanderer Suppiya spoke in various ways against the Buddha, against the Dharma, and against the Sangha, but the wanderer's pupil, the youth Brahma,datta, on the other hand, spoke in various ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dharma, and in praise of the Sangha.

Thus, the two, teacher and pupil, following close behind the Blessed One and the community of monks, spoke in a manner directly contradicting one another.'

This, bhante, was the topic of conversation that we were having when the Blessed One arrived.

Dealing with the opinions of others

5 <1.5> DO NOT RESENT THOSE WHO SPEAK AGAINST THE THREE JEWELS. "Bhikshus, if anyone were to speak against me, or against the Dharma, or against the Sangha, **[5]** on account of that you should not feel resentful, nor dejected, nor discontented in your heart.[5]

For if you, bhikshus, if you were to become[6] angry or offended, when anyone were to speak against me, or against the Dharma, or against the Sangha, it would only be an obstacle for you.

Or, bhikshus, if you were to become angry or offended, when anyone were to speak against me, or against the Dharma, or against the Sangha, would you be able to know whether what they said is well spoken or ill spoken?"

"Certainly not, bhante."

"Bhikshus, if anyone were to speak against me, or against the Dharma, or against the Sangha, you should penetrate [unravel] what is false as being false, saying:

'It is false for this reason; it is untrue for this reason. This is not so with us; this is not found in us.'[7]

6 <1.6> DO NOT DELIGHT IN THOSE WHO SPEAK WELL OF THE THREE JEWELS. Bhikshus, if anyone were to speak well of me, or of the Dharma, or of the Sangha, on account of that you should not feel joyful, nor happy, nor elated in your heart.

For if you, bhikshus, were to feel joyful, or happy, or elated, when anyone were to speak well of me, or of the Dharma, or of the Sangha, it would only be an obstacle for you.

Bhikshus, if anyone were to speak well of me, or of the Dharma, or of the Sangha, you should declare what is true as being true, saying:

'For this reason, this is true; for this reason, this is a fact. This is so with us; this is found in us.'

---

[5] "[Y]ou should not feel…discontented in your heart," *tatra tumhehi na āghāto na appaccayo na cetaso anabhiraddhi karaṇīyā.*

[6] "If you were to become," *assatha,* pot 2nd person pl of *atthi,* "it/he/she is."

[7] *Iti pi etam abhūtaṁ, iti pi etam atacchaṁ, n'atthi c'etaṁ amhesu, na ca pan'etam amhesu saṁvijjatî ti.* The first 2 sentences can also be rendered: "

II. THE ANALYSIS OF MORAL VIRTUE[8]

7 <1.7> Bhikshus, it is only the minor and the insignificant points of mere moral virtue that a worldling would speak of when praising the Tathagata. And what, bhikshus, are minor and insignificant points of mere moral virtue that a worldling would speak of when praising the Tathagata? **[4]**

1. THE SHORT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE (*cūḷa,sīla*)

Right bodily conduct

8 <1.8>[9] (1) Here, bhikshus, having abandoned the destruction of life, the recluse Gotama abstains from destroying life. He dwells with rod and weapon laid down, conscientious,[10] merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

(2) Having abandoned the taking of what is not given, the recluse Gotama abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a pure mind.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

(3) Having abandoned incelibacy, he lives a celibate life, living apart, refraining from the sexual act,[11] the way of the village.[12]

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

Right Speech

9 <1.9> (4) Having abandoned false speech, the recluse Gotama abstains from false speech. He speaks the truth, holds to the truth as his bond, trustworthy, reliable, no deceiver of the world.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

(5) Having abandoned divisive speech the recluse Gotama abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there.

Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or consolidating those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks words of concord.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

(6) Having abandoned abusive speech, the recluse Gotama abstains from abusive speech. He speaks words that are humane, soothing, loving, touching, urbane, and delightful and pleasant to the multitude.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

(7) Having abandoned idle chatter, the recluse Gotama abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is true, what is in accordance with the goal [or, what is beneficial][13]. He speaks on

---

[8] These 3 sections (comprising 13 items or groups) on moral virtue [§§7-27] occur verbatim (in whole or with some omissions) in all of the first 13 suttas and may once have formed a separate "tract" (D:RD 1:3 n1). See Gethin 2001: 195 f. This section on moral virtue forms the first part of the full *sāmaññ a,phala* (fruits of recluseship) passage: see **Sāmaññ a,phala S** (D 2) = SD 8.10 Introd 3.

[9] Cp §§8-20 with **Cūla Hatthipadopama S** (M 27.11-13/1:179 f) = **Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S** (M 38.31-33/-1:267).

[10] *lajjī*, "feel shame, modest," explain in the Comy on S 1:73 as "one who has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*)." Opp *alajjī*, shameless.

[11] *Brahma,cariya* is the supreme conduct or holy life, ie celibacy. DA points out that it involves refraining from other forms of erotic behaviour besides intercourse.

[12] *gāma,dhamma*, ie the way of the householder, vulgar (in the sense of being associated with the masses).

[13] *attha,vādī.*

the Doctrine and the Discipline. He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, **[5]** backed by reason, measured, connected with the goal.[14]

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

General

10 <1.10> (8) The recluse Gotama abstains from damaging seeds and plant life.[15]

Sāmaṇera,sikkhā 6-10

(9) He eats only once a day, refraining from the evening meal and from food at improper times.[16]

(10) The recluse Gotama abstains from dancing, singing, music and from watching shows.

(11) The recluse Gotama abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents and make-up.

(12) The recluse Gotama abstains from high and luxurious beds and seats.

(13) The recluse Gotama abstains from accepting gold and silver [money].

General

(14) The recluse Gotama abstains from accepting uncooked grain; raw meat; women and girls; male and female slaves; goats and sheep, fowl and pigs; elephants, cattle, horses, and mares.

(15) The recluse Gotama abstains from accepting fields and lands [property].[17]

(16) The recluse Gotama abstains from running messages [or errands].

(17) The recluse Gotama abstains from buying and selling [bartering and trading].

(18) The recluse Gotama abstains from dealing with false scales, false metals, and false measures.

(19) The recluse Gotama abstains from bribery, deception, and fraud.

(20) The recluse Gotama abstains from wounding, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, and violence.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

2. THE MEDIUM SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE (*majjhima,sīla*)

11 <1.11> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to damaging seeds and plant life such as these: plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, and seeds—the recluse Gotama abstains from damaging seeds and plant life such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata. **[6]**

12 <1.12> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to consuming stored-up goods such as these: stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, and stored-up meat—the recluse Gotama abstains from consuming stored-up goods such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

13 <1.13> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to watching shows such as these: dancing, singing, music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals and

---

[14] *attha,saṃhitaṃ.*

[15] Curiously, this replaces the precept against intoxicants which is omitted.

[16] "Improper times" here means between noon and the following dawn (V 1:83).

[17] The Buddha however accepted land from rajahs like Bimbisāra and Pasenadi, and others like Anāthapiṇḍaka and Visākhā, which were received in the name of the Sangha. What is connoted here is accepting land on a personal basis.

drums, painted scenes,[18] acrobatic and conjuring tricks,[19] elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, and troop movements—the recluse Gotama abstains from watching shows such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

14 <1.14> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to heedless and idle games such as these—

aṭṭha,pada	eight-row chess,[20]
dasa,pada	ten-row chess,
ākāsa	chess in the air,[21]
parihāra,patha	hopscotch,
santika	spillikins[22] [or jackstraws],
khalika	dice,
ghaṭika	stick games [hitting a short stick with a longer one],[23]
salāka,hattha	hand-pictures,[24]
akkha	ball-games [marbles],
paṅga,cīra	blowing through toy pipes [playing whistling games with folded leaves],[25]
vaṅkaka	playing with toy ploughs,[26]
mokkhacika	turning somersaults [acrobatics],[27]
ciṅgulika	playing with toy windmills,[28]
pattāḷaka	toy measures,
rathaka	toy chariots,[29] **[7]**
dhanuka	toy bows,
akkharika	guessing letters drawn in the air or on one's back,[30]
manesika	guessing thoughts,
yathā,vajja	mimicking deformities—

the recluse Gotama abstains from heedless and idle games such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

15 <1.15> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to using high and luxurious furnishings such as these[31]—over-sized couches,[32] couches adorned with carved animals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woollen coverlets, woollen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringe, silk coverlets

---

[18] *Sobha,nagarakaṃ*, "of the city of Sobha" (the city of the Gandharvas or heavenly musicians). RD thinks it refers to a ballet with fairy scenes. Bodhi: "art exhibitions."

[19] *Caṇḍālaṃ vaṃsaṃ dhopanaṃ*, an obscure phrase. The performers were presumable of the lowest caste. DA thinks of an iron ball (used for juggling?). Cf **Citta Sambhūta J** (J 4:390) where the phrase appears.

[20] The Sinhalese *sanna* says that each of these games was played with dice and pieces such as kings, etc. The word for the pieces ("men") is *poru* (from *purisa*).

[21] Possibly, blindfold chess.

[22] Or, spellicans.

[23] Rhys Davids: "Something like 'tipcat.' *Siṁ-kelīmaya* in Sinhalese." (D:RD 1:10 n5)

[24] The hand is dipped in paint or dye, then struck on the ground or a wall, so that the player creates the figure of an elephant, a horse, etc. See J 1:220. Thai literature, the boy genius Sri Thanonchai is well known for this skill.

[25] Sinh *pat-kulal.* Morris (JPTS 1889:205) compares it to the Marathī *pungī.*

[26] Skt *vṛka.* See JPTS 1889:206.

[27] See V 1:276; also JPTS 1885:49.

[28] Cf *ciṅgulāyitvā* (A 3.15.2/1:112) (Morris, JPTS 1885:50).

[29] This and the previous five are mentioned at M 1:266 as children's games.

[30] This shows that letters, perhaps writing, were known in 5th century India, and certainly by Asoka's time.

[31] This list recurs at V 1:192 = 2:163 = A 1:181.

[32] *Āsandiṁ,* "moveable settees, high, and six feet long" (RD). The Sinh *Sanna* explains that this is "a long chair for supporting the whole body." See D:RD 1:11 n4 for discussion.

embroidered with gems; large woollen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with awnings, couches with red cushions for the head and feet—the recluse Gotama abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

16 <1.16> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, enjoy scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these: rubbing, massaging, bathing, kneading;[33] using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara [darkening one's eye-lashes], bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed white robes—the recluse Gotama abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

17 <1.17> ANIMAL TALK. Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to animal talk,[34] such as these:

rāja,kathā	talk about kings,
cora,kathā	talk about robbers,
mahāmatta,kathā	talk about ministers of state,
senā,kathā	talk about armies,
bhaya,kathā	talk about danger [alarms],
yuddha,kathā	talk about battles,
anna,kathā	talk about food,
pāna,kathā	talk about drink,
vattha,kathā	talk about clothing,
sayana,kathā	talk about beds,
mālā,kathā	talk about garlands,
gandha,kathā	talk about scents,
ñāti,kathā	talk about relatives,
yāna,kathā	talk about vehicles,
gāma,kathā	talk about villages,
nigāma,kathā	talk about towns,
nagara,kathā	talk about cities,
janapada,kathā	talk about the countryside,
itthī,kathā	talk about women, **[8]**
[*purisa,kathā*	talk about men,]
sūra,kathā	talk about heroes,
visikhā,kathā	talk about street gossip,
kumbaṭṭhāna,kathā	talk that is gossip at the well [old maid's tales],
pubba.peta,kathā	talk about the dead,
nānatta,kathā	talk about diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and the future],
loka-k,khāyika	talk about the creation of the world,
samudda-k,khāyika	talk about the creation of the sea,
iti,bhavâbhava, kathā	talk about talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss][35]–

the recluse Gotama abstains from talking about low topics such as these.

---

[33] Ie rubbing powders into the body, massaging it with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs (DA 88, summarized): D 1:7,19; A 4:54,16; Nm 380,9.

[34] *Tiracchāna,kathā*, or "animal talk," as animals mostly walk parallel to the ground, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. Cf **Lohicca S** (D 1:228). See V 1:188; D 1:7, 178, 3:36; M 1:513, 2:1, 23; S 5:419; A 5:128; also D:RD 3:33; S:W 5:355; A:W 5:86. At DA 89, *gehasita,kathā* (householder talk) is grouped with *tiracchāna,-kathā.* See Pācittiya 85 where the group of 6 monks indulged in such talk (V 4:163); see V:H 3:82 nn.

[35] *Iti,bhavâbhāva,kathā*, may be rendered as "being and non-being" or as "profit and loss," but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

18 <1.18> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to debates such as these—

'You do not understand this Teaching and Discipline [this Dharma-Vinaya]. I understand this Teaching and Discipline. What could you understand of this Teaching and Discipline? You are practising wrongly. I am practising rightly. I am being consistent. You are inconsistent. What should be said first you said later. What should be said after you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!'[36]

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

19 <1.19> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are given to relaying messages and running errands for people such as these: kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmins, householders, or youths [who say],

'Go here, go there, take this there, fetch that here'—the recluse Gotama abstains from running messages and errands for people such as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

20 <1.20> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, engage in deceitful pretensions [to attainments], flattery [for gain], subtle insinuation or hinting [for gain], pressuring [for offerings], and pursuing gain with gain, the recluse Gotama abstains from such pretensions and flattery.[37]

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata. **[9]**

3. THE GREAT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE (*mahā,sīla*)

21 <1.21> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

aṅga	reading marks on the limbs [eg, palmistry, sole-reading];
nimitta	reading omens and signs;
uppāda	interpreting celestial events [lightning, falling stars, comets];
supina	interpreting dreams;
lakkhaṇa	reading marks on the body [eg, physiognomy, phrenology];
mūsikâcchinna	reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;
aggi,homa	offering fire oblations;
dabbi,homa	oblations from a ladle;
thusa,homa	oblations of husks;
kaṇa,homa	oblations of rice powder;
taṇḍula,homa	oblations of rice grains;
sappi,homa	oblations of ghee;
tela,homa	oblations of oil;
mukha,homa	offering oblations using oral spells;
lohita,homa	offering blood-sacrifices;
aṅga,vijjā	making predictions based on the fingertips;
vatthu,vijjā	determining whether the site for a proposed house or garden is propitious or not [geomancy];

[36] This is stock: **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1:8), **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 1:66), **Pāsādika S** (D 3:117), **Saṅgīti S** (D 3:210), **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 2:3), **Sāmagāma S** (M 2:245), **Hāliddakāni S 1** (S 3:12), **Viggāhika Kathā S** (S 5:418) and **Mahā Niddesa** (Nm 1:173). See Brahmajāla S, D 1:2 f. Cf **Alagaddûpama S** (M 22) where a similar statement is made regarding the wrong reason for learning the Dharma (M 22.10/1:133).

[37] For details, see Vism 1.61-82.

khatta,vijjā	making predictions for officers of state;
siva,vijjā	laying demons in a cemetery;
bhūta,vijjā	laying spirits;
bhūri,vijjā	reciting house-protection charms [or knowledge of charms recited by those living in an earthern house];
ahi.vijjā	snake charming;
visa,vijjā	treating poisoning;
vicchikā,vijjā	curing scorpion-stings;
mūsika,vijjā	curing rat-bites;
sakuṇa,vijjā	interpreting bird sounds;
vāyasa,vijjā	interpreting the cawing of crows
pakkajjhāna	foretelling the remaining duration of life;
sara,paritta	reciting charms for protection against arrows; and
miga,cakka	reciting charms to understand the calls of wild animals.

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

22 <1.22> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

maṇi,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky gems;
daṇḍa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky staffs;
vattha,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky garments;
asi,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky swords;
usu,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky arrows;
dhanu,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky bows;
avudha,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky weapons;
itthi,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky women;
purisa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky men;
kumāra,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky boys;
kumāri,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky girls;
dāsa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky male slaves;
dāsi,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky female slaves;
hatthi,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky elephants;
assa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky horses;
mahisa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky buffaloes;
usabha,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky bulls;
go,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky cows;
aja,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky goats;
maṇḍa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky rams;
kukkuṭa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky fowl;
vaṭṭaka,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky quails;
godhā,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky lizards [or iguana];
kaṇṇikā,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky long-eared rodents;[38]
kacchapa,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky tortoises;
miga,lakkhaṇa	determining lucky and unlucky animals

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

[38] *Kaṇṇika,lakkhaṇaṃ*, from *kaṇṇa*, "ear." DA thinks it means either ear-rings or house-gables, both of which do not fit here. Walshe follows the Thai tr which, probably following an old tradition, has *tun*, "bamboo-rat" (see McFarland, *Thai-English Dictionary*, p371). Franke says "an animal that is always mentioned with the hare" and considers that it must mean an animal with long ears.

23 <1.23> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus: **[10]**

the leaders [rajahs][39] will march forth [advance];
the leaders will return [retreat];
our leaders will attack, and their leaders will retreat;
their leaders will attack, and our leaders will retreat;
there will be triumph for our leaders and defeat for their leaders;
there will be triumph for their leaders and defeat for our leaders;
thus there will be triumph, thus there will be defeat

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

24 <1.24> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus:

canda-g,gāho bhavissati	there will be a lunar eclipse;
suriya-g,gāho bhavissati	there will be a solar eclipse;
nakkhatta-g,gaho bhavissati	there will be an occultation of an asterism;
candima,suriyānaṁ patha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	the sun and moon will go their normal courses;
candima,suriyānaṁ uppatha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	the sun and moon will go off-course;
nakkhattānaṁ patha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	the asterisms will go their normal course;
nakkhattānaṁ uppatha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	the asterisms will go off-course;
ukkā,pāto bhavissati	there will be a meteor shower;
disā,ḍāho bhavissati	there will be a darkening of the sky;
bhūmi,cālo bhavissati	there will be an earthquake;
deva,dundubhi bhavissati	there will be thunder (coming from a clear sky);
candima,suriya,nakkhattānaṁ uggamanaṁ ogamanaṁ saṁkilesaṁ vodānaṁ bhavissati	there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, and asterisms;
evaṁ vipāko canda-g,gāho bhavissati	such will be the result of the lunar eclipse;
evaṁ vipāko suriya-g,gāho bhavissati	such will be the result of the solar eclipse;
evaṁ vipāko nakkhatta-g, gāho bhavissati	such will be the result of the occultation of the asterism;
evaṁ vipāko candima,suriyānaṁ patha,gamanaṁ bhavissati	such will be the result of the sun and moon going their normal courses;
evaṁ vipāko candima,suriyānaṁ uppatha,gamanaṁ bhavissati	such will be the result of the sun and moon going off-course;
evaṁ vipāko nakkhattānaṁ patha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	such will be the result of the asterisms going off-course;
evaṁ vipāko nakkhattānaṁ uppatha,-gamanaṁ bhavissati	such will be the result of the asterisms going off-course;
evaṁ vipāko ukkā,pāto bhavissati	such will be the result of the meteor shower;
evaṁ vipāko disā,ḍāho bhavissati	such will be the result of the darkening of the sky;

[39] *Raññaṇ* (gen pl), ie the joint leaders (rajah) of a republican state in ancient India.

evaṁ vipāko bhūmi,cālo bhavissati	such will be the result of the earthquake;
evaṁ vipāko deva,dundubhi bhavissati	such will be the result of the thunderclap (coming from a clear sky);
evaṁ vipāko candima,suriya,-nakkhattānaṁ uggamanaṁ ogamanaṁ saṁkilesaṁ vodānaṁ bhavissati	such will be the result of the rising, the setting, the darkening, or the brightening of the sun, of the moon, and of the asterisms;

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus **[11]** would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

25 <1.25> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus:

subbuṭṭhikā bhavissati	there will be abundant rain;
dubbuṭṭhikā bhavissati	there will be a drought;
subhikkhaṁ bhavissati	there will be plenty;
dubhikkhaṁ bhavissati	there will be famine;
khemaṁ bhavissati	there will be rest and security;
bhayaṁ bhavissati	there will be danger;
rogo bhavissati	there will be disease;
ārogyaṁ bhavissati	there will be health [freedom from disease];
muddā	or, they earn their living by counting,
gaṇanā	by accounting;
saṅkhāna	by calculation;
kāveyya	by composing poetry; or
lokāyata	by teaching hedonistic arts and doctrines

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

26 <1.26> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

āvāhana	calculating auspicious dates for bringing in the bride (marriage);
vivāhana	calculating auspicious dates for bringing in the bridegroom,
saṁvadana	calculating auspicious dates for betrothals;
vivadana	calculating auspicious dates for divorces;
saṃkiraṇa	calculating auspicious dates for collecting debts;
vikiraṇa	calculating auspicious dates for making investments and loans;
subhaga,karaṇa	reciting charms for becoming attractive;
dubbhaga,karaṇa	reciting charms for becoming unattractive;
viruddha,gabbha,karaṇa	curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions [or, reviving the fetuses of abortive women];[40]
jivhā nittaddana	reciting spells to bind a person's tongue;
hanu,saṁhanana	reciting spells to bind a person's tongue, or to paralyze his jaws;
hatthâbhijappana	reciting spells to make one lose control of one's hands;
kaṇṇa,jappana	reciting spells to bring on deafness;
ādāsa,pañha	getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a mirror;
kumāri,pañha	getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a young girl;
deva,pañha	getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a spirit medium;
ādicc'upaṭṭhāna	worshipping the sun;
Mahat'upaṭṭhāna	worshipping Mahā Brahmā;[41]

[40] *Viruddha,gabbha,karaṇaṃ.*

[41] *Mahat'upaṭṭhānaṁ = Mahā,brahma,pāriycariyā* (DA 1:97). Cf UA 75 where it simply means "rendered great service" (UA:M 1:115).

abbhujjalana	bringing forth flames from the mouth; and
Sir'avhāyana	invoking the goddess of luck.

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

27 <1.27> Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

santi,kamma	promising gifts to deities in return for favors;
paṇidhi,kamma	fulfilling such promises;
bhūri,kamma	demonology;
vassa,kamma	teaching house-protection spells;
vossa,kamma	inducing virility and impotence;
vatthu,kamma	consecrating sites for construction;
vatthu,parikiraṇa	giving ceremonial mouthwashes;
ācamana	giving ceremonial ablution;
nahāpana	giving ceremonial bathing;
juhana	offering sacrificial fires;
vamana	preparing emetics;
virecana	preparing purgatives;
uddha,virecana	preparing expectorants;
adho,virecana	preparing diuretics;
sīse,virecana	preparing headache cures;
kaṇṇa,tela	preparing ear-oil;
netta,tappana	preparing eye-drops;
natthu,kamma	preparing oil for treatment through the nose;
añjana	preparing collyrium [eye ointment];
paccañjana	preparing counter-medicines;
sālākiya	curing cataracts;
sallakattika	practising surgery;
dāraka,tikicchā	practising as a children's doctor;
mūla,bhesajja anuppādāna	administering medicines for the body; and
osadhīnaṁ paṭimokkha	treatments to cure their after-effects

—the recluse Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.[42]

Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata.

Bhikshus, it is only these minor and the insignificant points of mere moral virtue that a worldling would speak of when praising the Tathagata. **[12]**

III. SPECULATIONS ABOUT THE PAST (*pubb'anta,kappa*)

28 <1.28> There are, bhikshus, other dharmas, deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful and sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, that the Tathagata, having realized for himself with direct knowledge, expounds to others—those who, rightly praising the Tathagata according to reality, would speak regarding these.

And what are these dharmas, deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful and sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself with direct knowledge, expounds to others—those who, rightly praising the Tathagata according to reality, would speak regarding these?

[42] It is the practice of medicine for gain that is here condemned. (Walshe)

29 <1.29> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **speculators about the past**,[43] who hypothesize about the past,[44] **[13]** and who assert various dogmas[45] regarding the past on eighteen grounds.[46]

And the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who hypothesize about the past, and who on eighteen grounds assert various dogmas regarding the past—based on what, invoking what, do they assert the eighteen grounds?

1. Eternalism (*sassata,vāda*), grounds 1-4

30 <1.30> There are, bhikshus, certain recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists,**[47] who on four grounds proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who are eternalists, on four grounds, proclaim the self and the world to be eternal?

(1) Eternal self and universe, based on recollecting up to 100,000 past lives

31 <1.31> Here (firstly), bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, touches [gains] mental concentration of such a level that his mind is thus concentrated[, pure, clear, unblemished, free from defilement],[48] recalls his manifold past existence, that is to say,

one birth, two, three, four, five births,
ten births, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'[49]

Thus he recalls his manifold past existence in their modes and their details. **[14]** He says thus:

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar.[50] And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

What is the reason for this?

'For I, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, have touched [gained] mental concentration of such a level that my mind thus

---

[43] *Pubb'anta,kappika.*

[44] *Pubb'antânudiṭṭhino,* see comy: 3.29.3.

[45] "Dogmas," *adhivutti,pada,* ie "points strongly spoken about."

[46] "Grounds" (***vatthu***) [§§29, 30, 35, 38, 50, 53, 58, 61, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 70a, 71, 74, 75, 77a, 78, 80a, 81, 83a, 84, 92, 93, 99a, 100a, 101, 102, 105-146b], clearly syn with *diṭṭhi-ṭ,ṭhāna* [§39n]. It is important to note that these 18 grounds, like the rest of the 62 *diṭṭhi-ṭ,ṭhānā* (standpoints) are "grounds for views," rather than "views" (*diṭṭhi*) in themselves, only major examples of which are given in this sutta. In other words, while the sutta gives an exhaustive list of possible grounds for views—a veritable "a perfect net" (*brahma,jāla*) in which are caught all bases for speculative views—only 62 examples (common in the Buddha's time) are given. See Bodhi 1978:4-6, 147 f.

[47] *Sassata,vādā,* lit "those who hold the doctrine of eternalism.".

[48] *Parisuddhe pariyodāte anaṅgaṇe vigatûpakkilese* (only in Ke, Se).

[49] This para as in **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.15.1/3:108 f). For details, see Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

[50] *Sassato attā ca loko ca vañjho kūṭ'aṭṭho esika-ṭ,ṭhāyi-ṭ,ṭhito.* Immediately following this, **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28) adds: "I know the past, when the world rolled out [expanded] or when it rolled in [contracted], but I do not know the future, whether the world will roll out [expand] or whether it will roll in [contract]" (D 28.15(1)/3:109 = SD 10.12). On the meaning of "barren, etc," see 3.102.

concentrated[, pure, clear, unblemished, free from defilement],[51] recall my manifold past existence, that is to say,

one birth, two, three, four, five births,
ten births, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, thus:

"There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here."

Thus I recall my manifold past existence in their modes and their details. Thus I know this:

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

Bhikshus, this is the first reason,[52] based on which, invoking which,[53] some recluses and brahmins who are eternalists proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

(2) Eternal self and universe, based on recollecting up to 10 aeons

32 <1.32> And secondly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists,** proclaim the self and the world to be eternal?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration of such a level that his mind is thus concentrated, recalls his manifold past existence, that is to say,

one world contraction and expansion,[54]
or two world contractions and expansions,
or three world contractions and expansions,
or four world contractions and expansions,
or five world contractions and expansions,
or ten world contractions and expansions,
or twenty world contractions and expansions, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, **[15]** such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'[55]

---

[51] *Parisuddhe pariyodāte anaṅgaṇe vigatûpakkilese* (only in Ke, Se).

[52] "Reason," *ṭhānaṁ.*

[53] "[B]ased on which, invoking which," *yam āgamma yam ārabbha,* lit "having arrived at which, beginning with which."

[54] *Saṁvaṭṭa,vivaṭṭaṁ.* Here, "rolling in" (contraction or collapse) (*saṁvaṭṭa*) and "rolling out" (expansion) (*vivaṭṭa*), refer to the 2 primary phases of the great aeon or cosmic cycle (*mahā,kappa*). Bodhi says that the ***saṁ-vaṭṭa,kappa*** (the contraction aeon) "is the period between the full evolution of a world-system and its complete dissolution, the ***vivaṭṭa,kappa*** [the expanding aeon], the period between the dissolution and the full evolution." (1978:67 n1). Bodhi also notes that the PED defs should be reversed; see Vism 13.27-71/414-423. Since both the phases end in a stable phase—the *saṁvaṭṭa,kappa* in a ***saṃvaṭṭa-ṭ,ṭhāyī*** (post-contraction stability), and the *vivaṭṭa,-kappa* in a ***vivaṭṭa-ṭ,ṭhāyī*** (post-expansion stability)—the two are often further divided into 4 ***asaṅkheyya,kappa*** (incalculable aeons), forming the great aeon. See **Kappa S** (A 4.156/2:142).

[55] This para is as in **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.15.2/3:109). For details, see Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

Thus he recalls his manifold past existence in their modes and their details. He says thus:[56]

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

What is the reason for this?

For I, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration of such a level that my mind is thus concentrated, recall my manifold past existence, that is to say,

one world contraction and expansion,
or two world contractions and expansions,
or three world contractions and expansions,
or four world contractions and expansions,
or five world contractions and expansions,
or ten world contractions and expansions,
or twenty world contractions and expansions, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'[57]

Thus I recall my manifold past existence in their modes and their details. Thus I know this:

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

Bhikshus, this is the second reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are eternalists proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

(3) Eternal self and universe, based on recollecting up to 40 aeons

33 <1.33> And thirdly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists,** proclaim the self and the world to be eternal?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, touches mental concentration of such a level that his mind is thus concentrated, recalls his manifold past existence, that is to say,

ten world contractions and expansions,
or twenty world contractions and expansions,
or thirty world contractions and expansions,
or forty world contractions and expansions, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'[58]

Thus he recalls his manifold past existence in their modes and their details. He says thus:

---

[56] Immediately following this, **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28) adds: "I know the past, when the world rolled out [expanded] or when it rolled in [contracted], and I know the future, too, when the world will roll out [expand] or when it will roll in [contract]." (D 28.15(2)/3:109 f = SD 10.12).

[57] This para is as in **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.15.2/3:109). For details, see Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

[58] This para is as in **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.15.3/3:110). For details, see Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

The self and the world are eternal, **[16]** barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

What is the reason for this?

For I, by means of ardour, by means of effort, by means of devotion, by means of heedfulness, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration of such a level that my mind is thus concentrated, recall my manifold past existence, that is to say,

ten world contractions and expansions,
or twenty world contractions and expansions,
or thirty world contractions and expansions,
or forty world contractions and expansions, thus:

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'

Thus I recall my manifold past existence in their modes and their details. Thus I know this:

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

Bhikshus, this is the third reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are eternalists proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

(4) Eternal self and universe of the rationalist and investigator

34 <1.34> And fourthly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists,** proclaim the self and the world to be eternal?

(4) Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin is a rationalist,[59] an investigator [experimenter].[60] Fabricating it through reasoning, having it investigated it through mental inquiry, by way of his own intelligence, he says thus:[61]

'The self and the world are eternal, barren, standing like a peak, steadfast as a firm pillar. And though these beings roam and wander through samsara, fall away and re-arise, yet the self and the world remain the same just like eternity itself.'

Bhikshus, this is the fourth reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are eternalists proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly[62]

35 <1.35> It is on these four grounds, bhikshus, that those recluses and brahmins who are eternalists proclaim the self and the world to be eternal.

Whatever recluses and brahmins there may be who proclaim the self and the world to be eternal, all of them do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.[63]

---

[59] *Takkī,* ie reasoners and logicians. See foll n.

[60] *Vīmaṁsī,* those who examine and investigate. Both the term "rationalist" and "investigator" clearly refers the academician, philosopher or scientist of our times. Here *takkī hoti vīmaṁsī* may be taken as either a dvandva (a reasoner and an investigator) or as tatpurusha (a reasoner and investigator, ie one who investigates through reasoning). In fact, *takkī,vīmaṁsī* may be taken as syn with *ākāra,parivitakka* ("rational investigation" or "investigative reasoning"). This is one of the 5 courses of knowledge, viz, faith (*saddhā*), approval (*ruci*), oral tradition (*anussava*), investigative reasoning (*ākāra,parivitakka*), and reflective acceptance of a view (*diṭṭhi,nijjhāna-k,khanti*) (M 95.14/-2:170, 101.11/2:218, 102.15/1:234).

[61] *So takka,pariyāhataṁ vīmaṁsânucaritaṁ sayam,paṭibhānam evam āha.*

[62] Comy calls §§35-36 (the refrain's first two paras) "the elucidation of emptiness" (*suññatā,pakāsana*) (DA 1:55, 100, 103; DAṬ 1:171): see Bodhi 1978:125 f for tr. See SD 25.12(7.1).

36 <1.36> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

'These standpoints,[64] thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.'

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding.[65] **[17]** And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][66] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

37 <1.37> These are those truths, bhikshus, that are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful and sublime, beyond the sphere reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, that the Tathagata, having realized for himself with direct knowledge, expounds to others—those who, rightly praising the Tathagata according to reality, would speak regarding these.

2. Partial-eternalism (*ekacca,sassata,vāda*), grounds 5-8

38 <2.1> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists regarding some things and non-eternalists regarding other things**,[67] and who, on four grounds, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal on four grounds?

(5) The Brahmās

39 <2.2> (1) There comes a time, bhikshus, sooner or later, after a long period of time, when this world contracts [collapses].[68] When the world is contracting [collapsing], beings mostly[69] arise in **the Ābhassara [streaming radiance] Brahmā world**.[70]

---

[63] *N'atthi ito bahiddhā.*

[64] "Standpoints," ***diṭṭhi-ṭ,ṭhāna*** [§§29, 51, 59, 66b, 70b, 72, 80b, 83b, 92a, 99b, 100b, 103], lit "view-stands," are found only at the end of each sub-set of the grounds (*vatthu*) [§29n]. As such, they refer to the 8 subsets, viz: I eternalism, II partial eternalism, III extensionism, IV endless hedging, V fortuitious arising, VI immorality, VII annihilationism, and VIII the supreme nirvana here and now. See A 2:242; It 48 f; Pm 1:138; MA 2:10, 110.

[65] *Tañ ca pajānanaṁ na parāmasati,* ie, he does not cling even to right view.

[66] *Paccattaṁ.*

[67] *Ekacca,sassatikā ekacca,asassatikā.*

[68] "Contracts," *saṁvaṭṭati,* lit "rolls back" or devolves. See §32 n on *Saṁvaṭṭa,vivaṭṭaṁ*. For parallel of this passage, see **Aggaññ S** (D 27.10a/3:84 = SD 2.19). At this point, it is interesting to look at **(Agga) Kosala S** (A 10.29/ 5:59-65) where the Buddha applies *agga* on two contrasting levels—the worldly and the spiritual—by declaring that is Kāsī-Kosala "Pasenadi is *agga*, but even Pasenadi changes; in the ten-thousand-world-system, Brahmā is *agga,* but even Brahmā changes; when the world contracts, Ābhassara is *agga,* but the Ābhassara gods change—a monk who sees this, turns away from what is *agga,* and is disinterested in it"—and each time with the refrain "how much more so in what is lesser" (*page'va hīnasmiṁ*) (cf **Alagaddûpamā S**: "Bhikshus, having known the parable of the raft, you should abandon even the Dharma, how much more that which is not Dharma." (M 22.14/1:135).) The **Kosala S** concludes with the Buddha declaring that the foremost (*etad-agga*) of all these things (mentioned earlier) is "the supreme nirvana here and now" (*diṭṭh'eva dhamme…nibbuto*).

[69] "Mostly" (*yebhuyyena*). Commenting on this passage, **Buddhaghosa** says that "'mostly' is used because the other beings are born either in higher Brahmā realms or in the formless realms" (DA 1:110). **Dhammapāla**, in his subcomy on Buddhaghosa's texts, adds: "'*or* in world-systems other than those in the process of contracting' is the alternative to be understood by the word *or.* For it is not possible to consider that all beings in the descents at that

There they dwell, mind-made,[71] feeding on zest,[72] self-luminous,[73] moving about through space, glorious—and they stay like that for a very long time.

40 <2.3> There comes a time, sooner or later, after a long period of time, when this world expands [re-evolves].[74] When the world is expanding,[75] an empty Brahmā-mansion[76] appears. Then a certain heavenly being, due to the exhaustion of his life-span, or due to the exhaustion of his merit, passes away from the Ābhassara realm and arises in the empty Brahmā-mansion.

There he dwells mind-made, feeding on zest, self-luminous, moving about through space, glorious—and he stays like that for a very long time.

41 <2.4> Then, as a result of dwelling there all alone for so long, unrest, discontent, agitation arise[77] in him, thus:

'O that other beings might come here, too!'[78]

Just then a being, due to the exhaustion of his life-span, **[18]** or due to the exhaustion of his merit, passes away from the Ābhassara realm and arises in the empty Brahmā-mansion in companionship with that being.

There they dwell, mind-made, feeding on zest, self-luminous, moving about through space, glorious—and they stay like that for a very long time.

42 <2.5> Thereupon, bhikshus, the being who first arose there thought thus:

'I am Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the Omniscient, the Omnipotent, the Lord God, the Maker, the Creator, the Chief, the Ordainer,[79] the Almighty, the Father of all that are and that will be.[80] By me have these creatures been created.

---

time are born in the form or formless existence, since it is impossible for those beings in the descents with the longest life span to be reborn in the human realm" (DAṬ 1:201, qu by Gethin, 1997:198 f). Thus Dhammapāla deals with Buddhaghosa's failure to take into account the karma of those beings who have committed one of the 5 karmas "with immediate result [arising in this life or the following birth]" (*ānantariya,kamma*, ie matricide, parricide, killing an arhat, wounding the Buddha, splitting the Sangha) when the aeon (*kappa*) end. If the karma of such beings have not run out, then surely, concludes Dhammapāla, they must be reborn in the hells of other world systems. Cf Kvu 13.1/476.

[70] *Saṁvaṭṭamāne loke yebhuyyena sattā ābhassara,saṁvattanikā honti.* Here, *saṁvattanika* (cf *saṁvaṭṭanika*) refers to one whose rebirth process is incapable of realizing arhathood (cf M 106.3/2:262; MA 4:61): see SD 17.8a (11.1). "Ābhassarā," a celestial world, one of the form worlds of the 2nd dhyana, is populated by luminescent beings who live on zest (*pīti*) and emanate lightning-like radiance. When the physical universe devolves or "contracts" (*saṁvaṭṭati*) due to "fire," it reaches up to Ābhassara (CpA 11; Vism 13.41/416 f).

[71] They are said to be "mind-made" (*mano,mayo*) because they are reborn by way of the dhyana-mind (*jhāna,-manena*) (DA 1:110).

[72] "Zest," *pīti,* alt tr "rapture, joy"; this term refers to a factor of the first 2 absorptions of meditation. It is not a sensation and hence does not belong to the feeling aggregate (*vedanā-k,khandha*) but a mental factor (*cetasika*) belonging to the formation aggregate (*saṅkhāra-k,khandha*), and it may be described as "joyful interest."

[73] On the Abhassara devas' self-luminosity and *pabhassara,* see Introd (9) above.

[74] "Expands," *vivaṭṭati,* lit "rolls open" or evolves.

[75] From here up to the end of this para, **Aggañña S** (D 27) reads: "beings, having fallen from the Ābhassara world, come to this world. And there they dwell mind-made, feeding on zest, self-luminous, moving about through space, glorious—and they stay like that for a very long time" and the goes on to describe the re-evolution of the earth (D 27.10b/3:84 f = SD 2.19).

[76] *Brahmā,vimānaṁ,* ie Brahmā's divine abode.

[77] "[U]nrest, discontent, agitation arises," *nibbusitattā anabhirati paritassanā uppajjati.* These 3 abstract nn are taken as a cpd, hence their common verb is sg.

[78] This is a an agitation arising on account of craving (*taṇhā,tasanā*): see 3.41.

[79] Comy: "I am the supreme ordainer. I am the one who appoints beings to their places, 'You be a noble [kshatriya], you a brahmin, you a merchant, you an artisan! You be a householder, you a renunciant! And you be a camel, you a cow!'" (DA 1:111 f)

[80] *Aham asmi Brahmā Mahā,brahmā abhibhū anabhibhūto aññad-atthu,daso vasavatti issaro kattā nimmātā seṭṭtho sañjitā* [vl *sājitā*] *vasī pitā bhūta,bhavyānaṁ.* This is stock: for humorous riposte to this, see **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11.80-83/1:220-222) = SD 1.7.

What is the reason for that?

Because first I thought: "O that other beings might come here, too!" And on account of this mental resolution of mine, these beings have come here.'

And this thought, too, arose in the beings who arose after him, thus:

'He must be Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the Omniscient, the Omnipotent, the Lord God, the Maker, the Creator, the Chief, the Ordainer, the Almighty, the Father of all that are and that will be. By this Lord Brahmā, have we been created.

What is the reason for that?

Because we see that he arose here first, and we arose after him.'

43 <2.6> Bhikshus, the being who first arose there had longer life, and greater beauty, and greater power. Those beings that arose later had shorter life, and lesser beauty, and lesser power.

44 Now, bhikshus, there is the case that a certain being, having fallen from that realm, comes here.[81]

Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. When he has gone forth into homelessness, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he recollects that past life, but recollects not what is before that.

He says thus:

'We are created by Lord[82] Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the Omniscient, the Omnipotent, the Lord God, the Maker, the Creator, the Chief, the Ordainer, the Almighty, the Father of all that are and that will be.

He is permanent, stable, eternal, not subject to change: he will remain so just as eternity itself.

But we have been created by that **[19]** Lord Brahmā and have come here [to this world]. We are impermanent, unstable, short-lived, subject to dying.'

This, bhikshus, is the first reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal.

(6) The Khiḍḍā,padosikā devas

45 <2.7> (2) And secondly, bhikshus, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal?

There are, bhikshus, devas called "**defiled by play**" (*khiḍḍā,padosikā*). They dwell much of the time immersed in the delights of laughter and play.

From dwelling much of the time immersed in the delights of laughter and play, they become forgetful, and on account of their forgetfulness, these devas fall from that realm.

46 <2.8> Now, bhikshus, there is the case that a certain being, having fallen from that realm, comes here [to this world].[83]

Having come here, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. When he has gone forth into homelessness, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he recollects that past life, but recollects not what is before that.

<2.9> He says thus:

'Those good[84] devas who are not defiled by play do not dwell much of the time immersed in the delights of laughter and play. Not dwelling much of the time immersed in the delights of laughter and play, these devas do not fall from their realm: they are permanent, stable, eternal, not subject to change: he will remain so just as eternity itself. **[20]**

---

[81] *Ṭhānaṁ kho pan'etaṁ, bhikkhave, vijjati yaṁ aññataro satto tamhā kāyā cavitvā itthattaṁ āgacchati.* That is, that Brahmā dies and is reborn on earth.

[82] *Bhavaṁ.*

[83] *Ṭhānaṁ kho pan'etaṁ, bhikkhave, vijjati yaṁ aññataro satto tamhā kāyā cavitvā itthattaṁ āgacchati.* That is, that Brahmā dies and is reborn on earth.

[84] *Bhonto,* an honorific.

But we were those defiled by play. Dwelling much of the time immersed in the delights of laughter and play, we became forgetful, and on account of our forgetfulness, we fell from that realm. We have come here [to this world]. We are impermanent, unstable, short-lived, subject to dying.'

This, bhikshus, is the second reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal.

(7) The Mano,padosikā devas

47 <2.10> (3) And thirdly, bhikshus, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal?

There are, bhikshus, devas called "**defiled by mind**" (*mano,padosikā*). They contemplate one another covetously much of the time.

From dwelling much of the time contemplating one another covetously, they defile their minds. On account of their defiled minds, their bodies weaken, their minds weaken. These devas fall from that realm.

48 <2.11> Now, bhikshus, there is the case that a certain being, having fallen from that realm, comes here.

Having come here [to this world], he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. When he has gone forth into homelessness, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he recollects that past life, but recollects not what is before that.

<2.12> He says thus:

'Those good devas who are not defiled by mind do not dwell much of the time contemplating one another covetously. Not dwelling much of the time contemplating one another covetously, these devas do not fall from their realm: they are permanent, stable, eternal, not subject to change: **[21]** they will remain so just as eternity itself.

But we were those defiled by mind. Dwelling much of the time contemplating one another covetously, we defiled our minds. On account of our defiled minds, our bodies weakened, our minds weakened. We fell from that realm.

We have come here [to this world]. We are impermanent, unstable, short-lived, subject to dying.'

This, bhikshus, is the third reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal.

(8) The rationalist-investigator's partly eternal, partly non-eternal universe

49 <2.13> (4) And fourthly, bhikshus, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse and brahmin is **a rationalist**[85] **or investigator**.[86] Fabricating it through reasoning, having investigated it through mental inquiry, by way of his own intelligence, he says thus:

'That which is called "eye," or "ear," or "nose," or "tongue," or "body"—this self is impermanent, unstable, not eternal, subject to change.

But that which is called "mind" (*citta*), or "thought" [mentation] (*mano*), or "consciousness" (*viññāṇa*)[87]—that is permanent, stable, eternal, not subject to change: it will remain so just as eternity itself.'

This, bhikshus, is the fourth reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal.

---

[85] *Takkī,* lit "reasoners, logicians." See foll n.

[86] *Vīmaṁsī,* those who examine and investigate. Both the term "rationalist" and "investigator" clearly refers the academician, philosopher or scientist of our times. See §34 above.

[87] On these three terms, see ***Viññāṇa*** = SD 17.8a(12).

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

50 <2.14> It is on these four grounds, bhikshus, that the good recluses and brahmins proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal, they do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

51 <2.15> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These **[22]** standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][88] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

52 These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

3. Doctrines of the World's Finitude and Infinity (*antânanta,vāda*): grounds 9-12

53 <2.16> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** [finitist-infinitists].[89] They proclaim the world to be finite or infinite on four grounds.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins proclaim the world to be finite or infinite on four grounds?

(9) The extensionists' finite, bounded universe

54 <2.17> (1) Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he dwells perceiving finitude in the world [perceiving the world as finite].

He says thus:

'This world is finite, bounded by a circle.[90]

What is the reason for this?

I, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration, such that I dwell perceiving finitude in the world.

Through this, I know thus: This world is finite, bounded by a circle.'

This, bhikshus, is the first reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite.

(10) The extensionists' infinite, unbounded universe

55 <2.18> (2) And secondly, bhikshus, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** proclaim the world to be finite or infinite?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, **[23]** he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he dwells perceiving finitude in the world.

---

[88] *Paccattaṁ.*

[89] *Antānantikā,* ie those who hold to the view of the finitude and the infinity of the world. The term "extensionists" is borrowed from TW Rhys Davids (D:RW 1:35).

[90] *Antavā ayaṁ loko parivaṭumo.* The "circle" refers to the horizon.

He says thus:

'This world is infinite, unbounded.[91]

Those recluses and brahmins who say thus: "This world is finite, bounded by a circle," they speak falsely.[92]

What is the reason for this?

I, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration, such that I dwell perceiving infinity in the world.

Through this, I know thus: This world is infinite, unbounded.'

This, bhikshus, is the second reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite.

(11) The extensionists' finite and infinite universe

56 <2.19> (3) And thirdly, bhikshus, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he dwells in the world perceiving it as *finite vertically [upwards and downwards], but as infinite laterally [across]*.

He says thus:

Those recluses and brahmins who say thus: "This world is finite, bounded by a circle," they speak falsely; and those recluses and brahmins who say thus: "This world is infinite, unbounded," they speak falsely, too.

'This world is both finite and infinite.[93]

What is the reason for this?

I, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, have touched mental concentration, such that I dwell in the world perceiving it as finite vertically [upwards and downwards], but as infinite laterally [across].

Through this, I know thus: This world is both finite and infinite.'

This, bhikshus, is the third reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite.

(12) The rationalist-investigator: the universe is neither finite nor infinite

57 <2.20> (4) And fourthly, bhikshus, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse and brahmin is a rationalist[94] or investigator.[95] Fabricating it through reasoning, having investigated it through mental inquiry, *by way of his own intelligence*, he says thus:

'This world is neither finite nor is it infinite.[96]

Those recluses and brahmins who say thus: "This world is finite, bounded by a circle," they speak falsely; those recluses **[24]** and brahmins who say thus: "This world is infinite, unbounded," they speak falsely, too; and those recluses and brahmins who say thus: "This world is both finite and infinite," they speak falsely, too.

This world is neither finite nor is it infinite.'

---

[91] *Ananto ayaṁ loko apariyanto.*

[92] "[T]hey speak falsely," *tesaṁ musā,* lit "(it is) their lie."

[93] *Antavā ca ayaṁ loko ananto ca.* See 3(76.2).

[94] *Takkī,* lit "reasoners, logicians."

[95] *Vīmaṁsī,* those who examine and investigate. Both the term "rationalist" and "investigator" clearly refers the academician, philosopher or scientist of our times. See §49 above.

[96] See 3(76.2).

This, bhikshus, is the fourth reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

58 <2.21> It is on these four grounds, bhikshus, that these recluses and brahmins who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who are extensionists proclaim the world to be finite or infinite, they do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

59 <2.22> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][97] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

60 These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

4. Doctrines of Endless Hedging (*amarā,vikkhepa,vāda*): grounds 13-16

61 <2.23> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **endless hedgers**.[98] When questioned about one point or other, they resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging?

(13) The ignorant endless hedgers who fear false speech

62 <2.24> (1) Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin does not know [does not understand] according to reality, 'This is wholesome'; he does not know according to reality, 'This is unwholesome.'[99] This occurs to him:

'I do not know according to reality what is wholesome or what is unwholesome.

If I, not knowing according to reality what is wholesome **[25]** or what is unwholesome, were to expound what is wholesome or what is unwholesome, on that account, desire, or lust, or hate, or aversion, might arise in me.

---

[97] *Paccattaṁ.*

[98] *Amara,vikkhepikā,* or "endless equivocators." TW Rhys Davids renders it as "who wriggle like eels," ie "eel-wrigglers" (D 1:37 ff).

[99] *Idaṁ kusalan ti yathā,bhūtaṁ na-p,pajānāti, idaṁ akusalan ti yathā,bhūtaṁ na-p,pajānāti.* The tr here is a parallel (near-literal) one. The foll paras are paraphrased for easier reading.

Should desire, or lust, or hate, or aversion, arise in me, that would be *falsehood*[100] on my part.
Should there be falsehood for me, I would be vexed.
Such vexation would be an obstacle[101] for me.'

As such, out of fear of speaking falsehood, loathing false speech,[102] he does not expound what is wholesome or what is unwholesome. And when questioned about one point or other, he resorts to evasive statements and to **endless hedging**, thus:

'I do not take it as this. I do not take it as that. I do not take it as otherwise. I do not take it to be not so.[103] I do not take it to be not not so.'[104]

This, bhikhus, is the first reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and to endless hedging.

(14) The ignorant endless hedgers who fear clinging

63 <2.25> (2) And, secondly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to **endless hedging**?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin does not know [does not understand] according to reality, 'This is wholesome'; he does not know according to reality, 'This is unwholesome.' This occurs to him:

'I do not know according to reality what is wholesome or what is unwholesome.

If I, not knowing according to reality what is wholesome or what is unwholesome, were to expound what is wholesome or what is unwholesome, on that account, desire, or lust, or hate, or aversion, might arise in me.

Should desire, or lust, or hate, or aversion, arise in me, that would be *clinging*[105] on my part.
Should there be clinging in me, it would vex me.
Such vexation would be an obstacle for me.' **[26]**

As such, out of fear of clinging, loathing clinging, he does not expound what is wholesome or what is unwholesome. And when questioned about one point or other, he resorts to evasive statements and to endless hedging, thus:

'I do not take it as this. I do not take it as that. I do not take it as otherwise. I do not take it to be not so. I do not take it to be not not so.'

This, bhikhus, is the second reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and to endless hedging.

(15) The ignorant endless hedgers who fear being cross-questioned

64 <2.26> (3) And, thirdly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to **endless hedging**?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin does not know [does not understand] according to reality, 'This is wholesome'; he does not know according to reality, 'This is unwholesome.' He thinks thus:

'I do not know according to reality what is wholesome or what is unwholesome.

Now, there are recluses and brahmins who are wise, subtle, experienced in debate, who go about shooting down, indeed, tearing asunder, the views of others with their wisdom.[106] They might cross-examine me, ask me for reasons, invite me to address issues therein.[107]

---

[100] *Musā.*

[101] *Antarāya,* ie, an obstacle to attaining heaven (*sagga*) or the religious path (*magga*) (DA 1:115).

[102] *Musā,vāda,bhayā musā,vāda,parijegucchā.* That is, out of fear and loathing to speaking falsely, due to moral shame and moral fear.

[103] That is, "I do not take it to be none of the previous three."

[104] *Evam pi me no. Tathā ti pi me no. Aññathā pi me no. No ti pi me no. No no ti pi me no ti.*

[105] *Upādāna.*

But when cross-examined, asked for reasons, invited to address issues therein, *I am unable to answer them*.

Should I be unable to answer, it would vex me.

Such vexation would be an obstacle for me.'

As such, out of fear of being cross-examined, loathing cross-examination,[108] he does not expound what is wholesome or what is unwholesome. And when questioned about one point or other, he resorts to evasive statements and to endless hedging, thus:

'I do not take it as this. I do not take it as that. I do not take it as otherwise. I do not take it to be not so. I do not take it to be not not so.'

This, bhikhus, is the third reason, based on which, invoking which, **[27]** some recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and to endless hedging.

(16) The dull endless hedgers

65 <2.27> (4) And, fourthly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to **endless hedging**?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin is *dull and stupid*. On account of his dullness and stupidity, when questioned about one point or other, he resorts to evasive statements and to endless hedging, thus:[109]

'(A) 1. 'If you were to ask me whether there is a world beyond [a hereafter], if I thought that it exists, I would declare to you, "It is so."

But I do not take it thus. I do not take it in that way. I do not take it in any other way. I do not take it to be not so. I do not take it to be not not so.

2. …whether there is no hereafter…
3. ...whether there both is and is not a hereafter…
4. ...whether there neither is nor is not a hereafter...

(B) 1. ...whether there are spontaneously-born beings.
2. ...whether there no spontaneously-born beings.
3. ...whether there both are and are not spontaneously-born beings.
4. ...whether there neither are nor are not spontaneously-born beings.

(C) 1. …whether good and evil actions have fruit and result…
2. …whether good and evil actions have no fruit and result…
3. …whether good and evil actions both have and have not fruit and result…
4. …whether good and evil actions neither have nor have not fruit and result…

(D) 1. ...whether the Tathāgata [one thus-come] exists after death…
2. ...whether the Tathāgata does not exist after death…
3. …whether the Tathāgata both exists and does not exist after death…
4. ...whether the Tathāgata neither exists nor not exists after death…,

I would declare to you, "It is so."

But I do not take it as this. I do not take it as that. I do not take it as otherwise. I do not take it to be not so. I do not take it to be not not so.'

This, bhikhus, is the fourth reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins, when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and to endless hedging.

---

[106] *Santi hi kho pana samaṇa,brāhmaṇā paṇḍitā nipuṇā kata,para-p,pavādā vāda,vedhi,rūpā vobhindantā maññe caranti paññā,gatena diṭṭhi,gatāni.*

[107] *Ye maṁ tattha samanuyuñjeyyuṁ samanugāheyyuṁ samanubhāseyyuṁ.*

[108] *Anuyoga,bhayā anuyoga,parijegucchā.*

[109] In **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2), the foll 20 statements are attr to the agnostic and hedger Sañjaya Belaṭṭha,putta (D 2.30-32/1:59 f) = SD 8.10.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

66a <2.28> It is on these **[28]** four grounds, bhikshus, that these recluses and brahmins who are endless hedgers, who when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and endless hedging. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who are endless hedgers, who when questioned about one point or other, resort to evasive statements and endless hedging, they do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

66b <2.29> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][110] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

66c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

5. Doctrines of Fortuitous Arising (*adhicca,samuppanna,vāda*): grounds 17-18

67 <2.30> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **fortuitous originationists**,[111] who, on two grounds, proclaim that the self and the world arise fortuitously [by chance].

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins proclaim that the self and the world to arise [originate] fortuitously?

(17) Fortuitous arising (the non-percipient beings)

68 <2.31> (1) There are, bhikshus, devas called '**non-percipient beings**' [*asaññ a,satta*],[112] who when perception arises in them, they fall from that realm.

Now, bhikshus, there is the case where a certain being, having fallen from that realm, comes here [to this world].

Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. When he has gone forth into homelessness, by means of exertion, by means of striving, by means of devotion, by means of diligence, by means of right attention, he touches [attains] mental concentration, such that he recollects that past life, **[29]** but recollects not what is before that.

He says thus:

'The self and the world have arisen fortuitously [by chance].

What is the reason for this?

Because I did not exist before, but now I am. Not having existed before, I have sprung into being.'[113]

This, bhikshus, is the first reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are fortuitous originationists proclaim that the self and the world have arisen fortuitously.

(18) Fortuitous arising (the rationalist-investigators)

---

[110] *Paccattaṁ.*

[111] *Adhicca,samuppannikā.*

[112] They are located in the 4th-dhyana heavens just below the Pure Abodes (*suddh'āvāsa*). Their life-span is 500 aeons (Vbh 1028/425).

[113] *Ahaṁ hi pubbe nâhosiṁ. So'mhi etarahi ahutvā sattattāya pariṇato ti.*

69 <2.32> (2) And secondly, based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins proclaim that the self and the world to arise [originate] fortuitously?

Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse and brahmin is **a rationalist**[114] **or investigator**.[115] Fabricating it through reasoning, having investigated it through mental inquiry, *by way of his own intelligence*, he says thus:

'The self and the world have arisen fortuitously [by chance].'

This, bhikshus, is the second reason, based on which, invoking which, some recluses and brahmins who are fortuitous originationists proclaim that the self and the world have arisen fortuitously.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

70a <2.33> It is on these four grounds, bhikshus, that the good recluses and brahmins proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who proclaim the self and the world to be partly eternal and partly non-eternal, they do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

70b <2.34> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][116] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

70c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, **[30]** declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

Summary of speculations about the past

71 <2.35> Bhikshus, it is on these eighteen grounds[117] that those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who hypothesize about the past, assert various dogmas regarding the past.

Whatever recluses and brahmins there may be who proclaim the self and the world to be eternal, all of them do so on these four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

72 <2.36> This, bhikshus, the Tathagata knows, thus:

'These standpoints thus grasped, thus wrongly clung to, lead to such a destiny, to such a hereafter.'

And the Tathagata knows, too, what is beyond this. Yet he does not wrongly cling to even that understanding. Not wrongly clinging, he knows coolness [nirvana] for himself.

Bhikshus, having understood *the arising and passing away of feelings* as they really are, and their gratification, and their disadvantages, and the escape regarding them, the Tathagata is liberated through non-clinging.

73 These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

IV. SPECULATIONS ABOUT THE FUTURE

---

[114] *Takkī,* lit "reasoners, logicians."

[115] *Vīmaṁsī,* those who examine and investigate. Both the term "rationalist" and "investigator" clearly refers the academician, philosopher or scientist of our times. See §49 above.

[116] *Paccattaṁ.*

[117] "Grounds" (*diṭṭhi-ṭ,ṭhāna,* lit stands for views). See §29 above.

(*apar'anta,kappa*)

74 <2.37> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the future, who hypothesize about the future, and who on forty-four grounds[118] assert various dogmas regarding the future.

And the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the future, who hypothesize about the future, and who on forty-four grounds assert various dogmas regarding the future—based on what, invoking what, do they assert the forty-four grounds?

1. Doctrines of Conscious Survival[119] (*saññī,vāda*): grounds 19-34

(19)-(34) Conscious survival

75 <2.38> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who hold **the doctrine of [31] conscious survival after death**.[120] They proclaim conscious survival after death on sixteen grounds.

And the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of conscious survival after death—based on what, invoking what, do they assert the sixteen grounds?

76 They proclaim it, thus: 'The self [soul], after death, does not decay, is conscious and:

(A)	1.	**(19)**	has form [is material]	(*rūpī*);
	2.	**(20)**	formless	(*arūpī*);
	3.	**(21)**	both has form and is formless	(*rūpī ca arūpī ca*);
	4.	**(22)**	neither has form nor is formless	(*n'eva rūpī nârūpī*);
(B)	5.	**(23)**	finite	(*antavā*);
	6.	**(24)**	infinite	(*anantavā*);
	7.	**(25)**	both finite and infinite	(*antavā ca anantavā ca*);
	8.	**(26)**	neither finite nor infinite	(*n'ev'antavā nânantavā*);
(C)	9.	**(27)**	of unified consciousness [perception]	(*ekatta,saññī*);
	10.	**(28)**	of diversified consciousness	(*nānatta,saññī*);
	11.	**(29)**	of limited consciousness	(*paritta,saññī*);
	12.	**(30)**	of boundless consciousness	(*appamāṇā,saññī*);
(D)	13.	**(31)**	undividedly happy	(*ekanta,sukhī*);
	15.	**(32)**	undividedly suffering [unsatisfactory]	(*ekanta,dukkhī*);
	15.	**(33)**	both happy and suffering	(*sukhī,dukkhī*);
	16.	**(34)**	neither happy nor suffering	(*adukkham-asukhī*).

77a <2.39> It is on these sixteen grounds, bhikshus, that these recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of conscious survival after death. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who hold the doctrine of conscious survival after death, they do so on these sixteen grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

77b <2.40> This, bhikshus, the Tathagata knows, thus:

'These standpoints thus grasped, thus wrongly clung to, lead to such a destiny, to such a hereafter.'

---

[118] Grounds (19)-(62). See §29 above.

[119] "Conscious survival" is a more idiomatic tr of *saññī* here. Bodhi has "percipient immortality" for the sake of "a more literal rendering…to maintain consistency with the commentarial methods of explanation" (1978:80 n).

[120] *Uddham-āghātanika saññī,vādā.* CPD suggests the correct reading as prob *-ghātanika.* TW Rhys Davids: "Literally 'who are After-deathers, Conscious-maintainers.' These summary epithets are meant to be contemptuous, and the word chosen for death adds to the force of the phrase. It is not the usual word, but *āghātana* (so read in the text), meaning literally 'shambles, place of execution.' The ordinary phrase would have been *parammaraṇikā.*" (D:RD 1:43 n2)

And the Tathagata knows, too, what is beyond this. Yet he does not wrongly cling to even that understanding. Not wrongly clinging, he knows coolness [nirvana] for himself.

Bhikshus, having understood as they really are the arising and passing away of feelings, and their gratification, and their disadvantages, and the escape regarding them, the Tathagata is liberated through non-clinging.

77c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, **[32]** declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

2. Doctrines of Non-conscious Survival[121] (*asaññī,vāda*): grounds 35-42

(35)-(42) Non-conscious survival

78 <3.1> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who hold **the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death**.[122] They proclaim non-conscious survival after death on eight grounds.

And the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death—based on what, invoking what, do they assert the eight grounds?

79 <3.2> They proclaim it, thus: 'The self [soul], after death, does not decay, is non-conscious and:

(A)	1.	**(35)** has form	(*rūpī*);
	2.	**(36)** formless	(*arūpī*);
	3.	**(37)** both has form and is formless	(*rūpī ca arūpī ca*);
	4.	**(38)** neither has form nor is formless	(*n'eva rūpī nârūpī*);
(B)	5.	**(39)** finite	(*antavā*);
	6.	**(40)** infinite	(*anantavā*);
	7.	**(41)** both finite and infinite	(*antavā ca anantavā ca*);
	8.	**(42)** neither finite nor infinite	(*n'ev'antavā nânantavā*);

80a <3.3> It is on these eight grounds, bhikshus, that these recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who hold the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death, they do so on these eight grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

80b <3.4> This, bhikshus, the Tathagata knows, thus:

'These standpoints thus grasped, thus wrongly clung to, lead to such a destiny, to such a hereafter.'

And the Tathagata knows, too, what is beyond this. Yet he does not wrongly cling to even that understanding. Not wrongly clinging, he knows coolness [nirvana] for himself.

Bhikshus, having understood as they really are the arising and passing away of feelings, their gratification, their disadvantage, and the escape regarding them, the Tathagata is liberated through non-clinging.

80c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, **[33]** declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

3. Doctrines of Neither Conscious Nor Non-conscious Survival[123]

---

[121] "Non-conscious survival" is a more idiomatic tr of *saññī* here. Bodhi has "percipient immortality" for the sake of "a more literal rendering…to maintain consistency with the commentarial methods of explanation" (1978:80 n).

[122] *Uddham-āghātanika asaññī,vādā.* See §75n above.

[123] The usu tr of *n'eva,saññī,nâsaññī* is "neither percipient nor non-percipient," but here for the sake of uniformity, I have rendered it less technically.

(*n'eva,saññī,nâsaññī,vāda*): grounds 43-50

(43)-(50) Neither conscious non non-conscious survival

81 <3.5> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who hold **the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death**.[124] They proclaim neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death on eight grounds.

And the good [honorable] recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death—based on what, invoking what, do they assert the eight grounds?

82 <3.6> They proclaim it, thus: 'The self [soul], after death, does not decay, is neither conscious nor non-conscious and:

(A)	1. **(43)**	has form	(*rūpī*);
	2. **(44)**	formless	(*arūpī*);
	3. **(45)**	both has form and is formless	(*rūpī ca arūpī ca*);
	4. **(46)**	neither has form nor is formless	(*n'eva rūpī nârūpī*);
(B)	5. **(47)**	finite	(*antavā*);
	6. **(48)**	infinite	(*anantavā*);
	7. **(49)**	both finite and infinite	(*antavā ca anantavā ca*);
	8. **(50)**	neither finite nor infinite	(*n'ev'antavā nânantavā*);

83a <3.7> It is on these eight grounds, bhikshus, that these recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who hold the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death, they do so on these eight grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

83b <3.8> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][125] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

83c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

4. Doctrines of Annihilationism (*uccheda,vāda*): grounds 51-57

[34]

84 <3.9> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins who are **annihilationists**.[126] They proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being,[127] on seven grounds.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who are annihilationists proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing[128] being, on seven grounds?

---

[124] *Uddham-āghātanika n'eva,saññī,nâsaññī,vādā.* See §49n above.

[125] *Paccattaṁ.*

[126] *Uccheda,vādā.*

[127] *Sato sattassa ucchedaṁ vināsaṁ vibhavaṁ paññāpenti.* PTS omits *sato.* "Since the destruction of the non-existing (*asato*) is impossible, the words '(the annihilation) of an existing being." (DAṬ 1:226)

[128] *Sato,* missing from PTS.

(51) Annihilationist view of self (physically arisen)

85 <3.10> 1. Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin holds this doctrine, holds this view:

'The self, good sir, has physical form,[129] is composed of the four great elements,[130] arising from mother and father.[131]

Good sir, when this self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(52) Annihilationist view of self (divine of the sense-sphere)

86 <3.11> 2. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that this self is completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self—divine, having physical form, of the sense-sphere, partaking of material food.[132] You neither know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(53) Annihilationist view of self (mind-made)

87 <3.12> 3. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that the completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self—divine, having physical form, mind-made, endowed with all the limbs and organs, without defect in any faculty.[133] You neither know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(54) Annihilationist view of self (sphere of infinite space)

88 <3.13> 4. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that the completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self that, having completely transcended perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, through non-attention to perceptions of diversity, contemplating, "Infinite space," attains to the sphere of infinite space.[134] You neither **[35]** know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(55) Annihilationist view of self (sphere of infinite consciousness)

89 <3.14> 6. To him another says thus:

---

[129] *Rūpī.* On form (*rūpa*), see SD 17.2.

[130] "Composed of the four great elements," *mahā,bhūtika.* On the four elements (*mahā,bhūta*), see **Mahā Rāhu-l'ovāda S** (M 62.8/1:421 f) = SD 3.11 Introd 4.

[131] *Rūpī cātum,mahā,bhūtiko mātā,pettika,sambhavo.*

[132] *Dibbo rūpī kāmâvacāro kabaliṅkār'āhāra,bhakkho.*

[133] *Dibbo rūpī mano,mayo sabbaṅga,paccaṅgī ahīndriyo.*

[134] *Sabbaso rūpa,saññānaṁ samatikkamā paṭigha,saññānaṁ attha,gamā nānatta,saññānaṁ amanasi,kārā ananto ākāso ti ākāsânañc'āyatanûpago.*

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that the completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self that, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite space, contemplating, "Infinite consciousness," attains to the sphere of infinite consciousness.[135] You neither know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(56) Annihilationist view of self (sphere of nothingness)

90 <3.15> 6. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that the completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self that, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite consciousness, contemplating, "There is nothing," attains to the sphere of nothingness.[136] You neither know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being.

(57) Annihilationist view of self (sphere of neither perception nor non-perception)

91 <3.16> 7. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, it is not to that extent that the completely destroyed and uprooted.

For there is, good sir, another self that, having completely transcended the sphere of nothingness, contemplating, "This is peaceful; this is sublime," attains to the sphere of neither perception nor non-perception.[137] You neither know nor see this. *I* know and see this.

Good sir, it is when *this* self is annihilated and destroyed when the body breaks up, and does not exist after death, to that extent [at that point], good sir, that this self is completely uprooted.'

In this way some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, non-existence of an existing being.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

92 <3.17> It is on these seven grounds, bhikshus, that the recluses and brahmins who are annihilationists proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being. Whatever recluses or **[36]** brahmins there may be who proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being, they do so on these seven grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

92a <3.18> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][138] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

---

[135] *Sabbaso ti ākāsânañc'āyatanaṁ samatikkama anantaṁ viññāṇan ti viññāṇañcâyatanûpago.*

[136] *Sabbaso ti viññāṇañcâyatanaṁ samatikkama n'atthi kiñcî ti akiñcañ'āyatanûpago.*

[137] *Sabbaso ti akiñcaññâyatanaṁ samatikkama santam etaṁ paṇītam etan ti n've,saññā,nâsañ'āyatanûpago.*

[138] *Paccattaṁ.*

92b These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

5. Doctrines of the supreme nirvana here and now (*diṭṭha,dhamma,nibbāna,vāda*): grounds 58-62

93 <3.19> There are, bhikshus, some recluses and brahmins **who hold the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now**.[139] They proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings, on five grounds.

And based on what, invoking what, do the good recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings, on five grounds?

(58) The supreme nirvana here and now (sense-pleasures)

94 <3.20> 1. Here, bhikshus, a certain recluse or brahmin holds this doctrine, holds this view:

'Good sir, when this self, endowed and replete with the five cords of sense-pleasures, revels in them,[140] to that extent, good sir, the self has attained to the supreme nirvana here and now.'

This is how some proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings.

(59) The supreme nirvana here and now (1st dhyana)

95 <3.21> 2. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, this self to that extent has *not* attained to the supreme nirvana here and now.

What is the reason for this?

For, good sir, sense-pleasures are impermanent, unsatisfactory, subject to change. Through their state of change and alteration, there arise sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain and despair.

But when **[37]** the self is secluded, good sir, this self, secluded from sense-pleasures, from unwholesome states, enters and dwells in the first dhyana, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness, born of solitude.[141]

To that extent, good sir, this self attains to the supreme nirvana here and now.'

This is how some proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings.

(60) The supreme nirvana here and now (2nd dhyana)

96 <3.22> 3. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, this self to that extent has *not* attained to the supreme nirvana here and now.

What is the reason for this?

Insofar as it has initial application (*vitakka*) and sustained application (*vicāra*), it is said to be gross.

But when the self is secluded, good sir, this self, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he reaches and dwells in the second

---

[139] *Diṭṭha,dhamma,nibbāna,vādā.*

[140] *Yato kho bho ayam attā pañcahi kāma,guṇehi samappito samaṅgi,bhūto paricāreti.* Bodhi colourfully renders *samappito samaṅgi,bhūto* as "furnished and supplied with," and *paricāreti* as "revels." I have rendered *samappito* as "replete" and *samaṅgi,bhūto* as "endowed with," but follow Bodhi's tr of *paricāreti.* See VbhA 2494/506.

[141] For details on the 1st dhyana, see **Sāmaññ a,phala S** (D 2.77/1:73 f) = SD 8.10.

dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.[142]

To that extent, good sir, this self attains to the supreme nirvana here and now.'

This is how some proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings.

(61) The supreme nirvana here and now (3rd dhyana)

97 <3.23> 4. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, this self to that extent has *not* attained to the supreme nirvana here and now.

What is the reason for this?

Insofar as it has zest (*pīti*), there is mental excitation (*ubbillāvitatta*), and as such is said to be gross.

But when the self is secluded, good sir, this self, with the fading away of zest, he remains equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body. He reaches and dwells in the third dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, "Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness."[143]

To that extent, good sir, this self attains to the supreme nirvana here and now.'

This is how some proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings.

(62) The supreme nirvana here and now (4th dhyana)

98 <3.24> 5. To him another says thus:

'There is here, good sir, this self that you speak of. I do not deny that. But, good, sir, this self to that extent has *not* attained to the supreme nirvana here and now.

What is the reason for this?

Insofar as it has happiness (*sukha*), there is enjoyment [ideating] (*ābhoga*), and as such is said to be gross.

But when the self is secluded, good sir, this self, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain—and with the earlier disappearance of happiness and displeasure **[38]**—he reaches and dwells in the fourth dhyana, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.[144]

To that extent, good sir, this self attains to the supreme nirvana here and now.'

This is how some proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings.

Refrain: Praising the Tathagata rightly

99a <3.25> It is on these five grounds, bhikshus, that the recluses and brahmins who hold the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings, on five grounds. Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who proclaim proclaim the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings, they do so on these five grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

99b <3.26> This, bhikshus, the Tathāgata understands. And he understands thus:

"These standpoints, thus grasped, thus misapprehended, will lead to such a future destiny, to such a state beyond.

And thus, the Tathāgata understands; he understands, too, what transcends this. Yet, he does not misapprehend [cling on to] that understanding. And because he is free from wrong grasping, he has known for himself [within himself][145] the cool [happy] state.

Having understood, as they really are, the arising, and the ending, and the gratification, and the danger, and the escape regarding feelings, the Tathagata, bhikshus, is liberated through non-clinging.

---

[142] For details on the 2nd dhyana, see **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.79/1:74 f) = SD 8.10.

[143] For details on the 3rd dhyana, see **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.81/1:75) = SD 8.10.

[144] For details on the 4th dhyana, see **Sāmaññ,phala S** (D 2.83/1:75 f) = SD 8.10.

[145] *Paccattaṁ.*

99c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

Summary of speculations about the future

100a <3.27> Bhikshus, it is on these forty-four grounds that those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the future, who hypothesize about the future, assert various dogmas regarding the future.

Whatever recluses and brahmins there may be who are speculators about the future, who hypothesize about the future, assert various dogmas regarding the future, all of them do so on these forty-four grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

100b <3.28> This, bhikshus, the Tathagata knows, thus:

'These standpoints thus grasped, thus wrongly clung to, lead to such a destiny, to such a hereafter.'

And the Tathagata knows, too, what is beyond this. **[39]** Yet he does not wrongly cling to even that understanding. Not wrongly clinging, he knows coolness [nirvana] for himself.

Bhikshus, having understood as they really are the arising and passing away of feelings, and their gratification, and their disadvantages, and the escape regarding them, the Tathagata is liberated through non-clinging.

100c These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

Summary of the 62 grounds

101 <3.29> These, bhikshus, are the sixty-two grounds on which those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, assert their dogmatic notions.[146]

102 Whatever recluses or brahmins there may be who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, they all do so on these sixty-two grounds, or on any one of them. There is none beyond this.

103 <3.30> This, bhikshus, the Tathagata knows, thus:

'These standpoints thus grasped, thus wrongly clung to, lead to such a destiny, to such a hereafter.'

And the Tathagata knows, too, what is beyond this. Yet he does not wrongly cling to even that understanding. Not wrongly clinging, he knows coolness [nirvana] for himself.

Bhikshus, having understood as they really are the arising and passing away of feelings, and their gratification, and their disadvantages, and the escape regarding them, the Tathagata is liberated through non-clinging.

104 <3.31> These truths, bhikshus, are deep, difficult to see, difficult to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the sphere of reasoning, subtle, to be known by the wise, which the Tathagata, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, declares it.

And those who would rightly praise the Tathagata in accordance with reality would speak of them.

V. SAMSARA AND LIBERATION

1. Agitation and Vacillation (*paritassita,vipphandita*)

[146] "Dogmatic notions," *adhivutti,pada*.

105 <3.32> GROUNDS 1-4. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists** who proclaim on four grounds that the self and the world are eternal **[40]**—that is only the feeling (*veda-yita*) of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.[147]

106 <3.33> GROUNDS 5-8. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists regarding some things and non-eternalists regarding other things** who proclaim on four grounds that the self and the world are eternal—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

107 <3.34> GROUNDS 9-12. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** [finitist-infinitists] who proclaim on four grounds the world to be finite or infinite—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

108 <3.35> GROUNDS 13-16. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **endless hedgers** who, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

109 <3.36> GROUNDS 17-18. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **fortuitous originationists**, who, on two grounds, proclaim that the self and the world arise fortuitously [by chance]—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

110 <3.37> GROUNDS 1-18: SPECULATORS ABOUT THE PAST. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **speculators about the past**, who, on eighteen grounds, hypothesize about the past, assert various dogmas regarding the past—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

111 <3.38> GROUNDS 19-34. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of conscious survival after death,** who on sixteen grounds proclaim conscious survival after death—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

112 <3.39> GROUNDS 35-42. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim non-conscious survival after death—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving. **[41]**

113 <3.40> GROUNDS 43-50. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

114 <3.41> GROUNDS 51-57. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who are **annihilationists,** who on seven grounds proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

115 <3.42> GROUNDS 58-62. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now**, who on five grounds proclaim the highest the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

116 <3.43> GROUNDS 19-62: THE FUTURISTS. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the future**, who hypothesize on forty-four grounds about the future, assert

---

[147] "The agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving" (*taṇhā,gatānaṁ paritasita.vipphanditam eva*). Comy qu this as an example of "agitation through views" (*diṭṭhi,tassanā*): see 3.41.

various dogmas regarding the future—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

117 <3.44> GROUNDS 1-62: THE PERFECT NET. Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, assert on sixty-two grounds their dogmatic notions—that is only the feeling of those who know not, who see not, merely the agitation and vacillation of those overcome by craving.

2a. Conditioned by Contact Sequence (*phassa,paccaya vāra*)

118 <3.45> Therein, bhikshus, that those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists [42]** who proclaim on four grounds the self and the world to be eternal—this is conditioned by contact [sense-stimulus] (*phassa*).

119 <3.46> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists regarding some things and non-eternalists regarding other things** who proclaim on four grounds that the self and the world are eternal—this is conditioned by contact.

120 <3.47> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** [finitist-infinitists] who proclaim on four grounds the world to be finite or infinite—this is conditioned by contact.

121 <3.48> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **endless hedgers** who, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging—this is conditioned by contact.

122 <3.49> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are **fortuitous originationists**, who, on two grounds, proclaim that the self and the world arise fortuitously [by chance]—this is conditioned by contact.

123 <3.50> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the past,** who hypothesize about the past, and who on eighteen grounds assert various dogmas regarding the past —this is conditioned by contact.

124 <3.51> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of conscious survival after death,** who on sixteen grounds proclaim conscious survival after death—this is conditioned by contact.

125 <3.52> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim non-conscious survival after death— this is conditioned by contact.

126 <3.53> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death—this is conditioned by contact.

127 <3.54> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who are **annihilationists,** who on seven grounds proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being—this is conditioned by contact.

128 <3.55> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now**, who on five grounds proclaim the highest the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings—this is conditioned by contact.

129 <3.56> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the future**, **[43]** who hypothesize on forty-four grounds about the future, assert various dogmas regarding the future—this is conditioned by contact.

130 <3.57> Therein, bhikshus, what those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, assert on sixty-two grounds their dogmatic notions—this is conditioned by contact.

2b. Conditioned by Contact (Negative Sequence)

131 <3.58> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists** who proclaim on four grounds the self and the world to be eternal—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact [sense-stimulus] (*phassa*).[148]

132 <3.59> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists regarding some things and non-eternalists regarding other things** who proclaim on four grounds that the self and the world are eternal—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

133 <3.60> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** [finitist-infinitists] who proclaim on four grounds the world to be finite or infinite—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

134 <3.61> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are **endless hedgers** who, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

135 <3.62> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are **fortuitous originationists**, who, on two grounds, proclaim that the self and the world arise fortuitously [by chance]—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

136 <3.63> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the past,** who hypothesize about the past, and who on eighteen grounds assert various dogmas regarding the past—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

137 <3.64> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of conscious survival after death, [44]** who on sixteen grounds proclaim conscious survival after death—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

138 <3.65> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim non-conscious survival after death—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

139 <3.66> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

140 <3.67> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who are **annihilationists,** who on seven grounds proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

141 <3.68> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now**, who on five grounds proclaim the highest the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

142 <3.69> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the future**, who hypothesize on forty-four grounds about the future, assert various dogmas regarding the future—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

143 <3.70> Therein, bhikshus, regarding those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold

[148] *Te vata aññatra phassā paṭisaṁvedissantî ti n'etaṁ ṭhānaṁ vijjati.*

various dogmatic views about both the past and future, assert on sixty-two grounds their dogmatic notions—it is indeed impossible that they would experience anything other than contact.

3. Exposition on the Rounds of Speculative Views (*diṭṭhi,gatikā,diṭṭhāna,vaṭṭa kathā*)

144 <3.71> Therein, bhikshus, those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists** who proclaim on four grounds the self and the world to be eternal;

those recluses and brahmins who are **eternalists regarding some things and non-eternalists regarding other things** who proclaim on four grounds that the self and the world are eternal, too;

those recluses and brahmins who are **extensionists** [finitist-infinitists] who proclaim on four grounds the world to be finite or infinite, too;

those recluses and brahmins who are **endless hedgers** who, when questioned about one point or other, resort, on four grounds, to evasive statements and to endless hedging, too;

those **[45]** recluses and brahmins who are **fortuitous originationists**, who, on two grounds, proclaim that the self and the world arise fortuitously [by chance], too;

those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the past,** who hypothesize about the past, and who on eighteen grounds assert various dogmas regarding the past, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of conscious survival after death,** who on sixteen grounds proclaim conscious survival after death, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim non-conscious survival after death, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death**, who on eight grounds proclaim neither conscious nor non-conscious survival after death, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who are **annihilationists,** who on seven grounds proclaim the uprooting, destruction, annihilation of an existing being, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who hold **the doctrine of the supreme nirvana here and now**, who on five grounds proclaim the highest the supreme nirvana here and now for existing beings, too;

those recluses and brahmins, who are **speculators about the future**, who hypothesize on forty-four grounds about the future, assert various dogmas regarding the future, too;

those recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, assert on sixty-two grounds their dogmatic notions—

they all (those recluses and brahmins) experience these *feelings* by way of repeated contacts through *the six bases of contacts*.

For them,

conditioned by feeling, craving arises;
conditioned by craving, clinging arises;
conditioned by clinging, existence arises;
conditioned by existence, birth arises;
conditioned by birth, decay-and-death arises;
conditioned by decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain and despair arise.

4. Ending of the Round, etc (*vivaṭṭa kathâdi*)

145 Bhikshus, when a monk understands according to reality the arising and ending of the six bases of contact, and their gratification, and their dangers, and the escape from them, then he indeed understands what transcends all these grounds.

Parables

146a <3.72> THE FISHERMAN. Whatever recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, with their sixty-two grounds—they are all caught within this net. When they emerge, they emerge caught in this net.

146b Bhikshus, just as a skillful fisherman or a fisherman's apprentice were to cast a fine-meshed net over a small pool of water might think thus:

'Whatever sizeable water creatures there are in this pool, all of them will be caught in this net. When they emerge, they do so caught right here **[46]** (in this net).'

Even so, bhikshus, whatever recluses and brahmins who are speculators about the past, who are speculators about the future, who are speculators about both the past and future, who hold various dogmatic views about both the past and future, with their sixty-two grounds—they are all caught in this net. When they emerge, they do so caught right here (in this net).

147 <3.73> THE MANGO BUNCH. The Tathagata's body, bhikshus, remains cut from the leash of existence. So long as the Tathagata's body stands, gods and humans will see him.

After the breaking up of the body and exhaustion of the life-faculty, gods and humans do not see him.

Bhikshus, just as when the stalk of a bunch of mangoes has been cut all the mangoes joined by the stalk go together with it, even so, the Tathagata's body remains cut from the leash of existence. So long as the Tathagata's body stands, gods and humans will see him.

After the breaking up of the body and exhaustion of the life-faculty, gods and humans do not see him."

Conclusion

148 <3.74> When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said this to the Blessed One:

"It is wonderful, bhante! It is marvellous, bhante! What, bhante, is the name of this Dharma exposition?"

"As such, Ānanda, this Dharma exposition here:

remember it as the net of the true goal (*attha,jāla*), or
remember it as the Dharma net (*Dharma,jāla*), or
remember it as the perfect net (*brahma,jāla*), or
remember it as the net of views (*ditthi,jāla*), or
remember it as the supreme victory in battle (*anuttara saṅgāma,vijaya*)."

149 The Blessed One said this. The monks joyfully approved[149] of the Blessed One's word. And while this exposition was being spoken, the ten-thousandfold world-system quaked.

— evaṁ —

060513 (Vesak); 061203; 070121; 080127

[149] "Joyfully approved," *attamanā…abhinanduṁ.*